GNOSIS | An International Refereed Journal of English Language and Literature

YKING BOOKS

ISSN 2394-0131

Gnosis

An International Journal of
English Language and Literature

Vol.9 No.1 October, 2022

Editor : Dr. Saikat Banerjee

GNOSIS

An International Refereed Journal of English Language and Literature

Vol. 9 -No.1 October, 2022

Table of Contents

Editorial

The October 2022 issue of GNOSIS had a very warm response from the readers in India and abroad that articles have been flowing in quick succession to fill the folder or this issue even before the deadline of 10 September 2022. The thumping reception of the journal shows the depth of multicultural issues in literature to which critics and readers are attracted. As a journal committed to quality research and writing, we are aware of the need to delink quality from publication cost. Hence, our decision is to charge no publication fee from the scholars whose papers will be published in the issues of GNOSIS. At the same time since GNOSIS is a self-financed venture, co-operation and support in the form of subscriptions are solicited from the readers and admirers of English Literature and Language from all over the world.

I would also like to take this opportunity to thank all the Academicians and well-wishers of GNOSIS who recommended GNOSIS for publication. There are twelve research/critical articles, four poems and one fiction in this issue. Before concluding, I would like to express my sincere gratitude to our esteemed members of the Board of Advisors and Review Editors for their selfless and tiresome efforts in assessing the articles very sincerely and giving their valuable remarks to bring out this issue in such a grand manner. I am also grateful to the revered contributors who have made this issue of the Journal a beautiful reality. Wishing all the readers a mental feast. Happy Reading!

Dr. Saikat Banerjee

Editor

Feminist Critique of Gender: Feminism and Literary Misogyny

Dr. Jyoti Yadav

Abstract: With the rise of feminism in Western hemisphere in modern age, the concept of gender has been questioned from multiple perspectives—social, cultural, literary and philosophical. The plethora of studies available in literature and cultural studies on relation between males and females often reveal some basic patterns on which these relations sustain. The stereotypical images of females as expressed in majority of literary and cultural works have been challenged by feminists as part of a project to ensure subjugation of females. Thus while the images of females in the works of male writers reveal a projection of male fantasy and a hidden wish fulfilment, female writers seek to write through their bodies and emotions. Gender, thus becomes in the hands of feminists a charged battleground which needs to be reclaimed by them to enable them to express their true self. Literary misogyny in this scheme of things becomes both intentional and unintentional strategy to subjugate and colonise female space. Instead of being an innocent lacuna on the part of certain male writers, it reveals political implications in which coded messages are passed from one generation to another, thus validating pseudo universalistic claims. The present paper seeks to understand diverse implications of gender as revealed in modern feminist criticism. Through it, a spectrum of literary misogyny as revealed in the works of most of the male writers is dissected, thus necessitating a need to revise grounds of canon-formation in literature and criticism.

Key words: Feminism, gender misogyny, criticism.

Feminism is a multi pronged movement affecting nearly all aspects of life, including literature. It was the natural outcome of centuries of struggle for women's rights. Although as a movement it was first noticed in 1960s, Mary Wollstonecraft's *A Vindication of the Rights of Women* (1792) is considered a landmark work and the manifesto of modern feminism. Margaret Fuller's *Woman in the Nineteenth Century* (1845) and John Stuart Mill's *The Subjection of Women* (1869) are two other milestones in the quest of women for self-realization, self-definition and self-assertion. In the Twentieth century Virginia Woolf ranks as the chief exponent of feminism with her collection of essays *Women and Writing* and *A Room of One's Own* (1929). Virginia

Woolf attacked patriarchal society for its being the root cause of educational, economic and cultural backwardness of women. *The Second Sex* (1949) by French writer Simone de Beauvoire is another landmark of feminist ideology and is regarded as the foundation of the present day feminism. This book is a powerful critique of the age-old cultural belief in woman as simply 'the negative object' and man as 'the defining, central subject.'

In America feminism made its presence feel through Mary Ellman's *Thinking about Women* (1968) and Kate Millett's *Sexual Politics* (1969). *Sexual Politics* by Kate Millett exposes Freud's male prejudices and some of the novelists's presentation of women as simply objects of sexual gratifications. According to her the essence of politics is power; and the task of feminist critics and theorists is to expose the ways of male dominance over females. This dominance which Millet defines as patriarchy constitutes "perhaps the most pervasive ideology of our culture and provides its most fundamental concept of power"(Sharma 2).

The feminist critics find the works of most of the male writers conspicuous by the presence of male gaze. Male gaze stands for the exaltation of manliness. It is the conscious glorification of virility and man's reality with a little or no consideration of the female experience. Catherine M. Rogers calls it literary misogyny or misogynistic sentiment. According to Rogers, a male writer follows it "unconsciously, intending neither to impugn the characters of individual women nor to keep women as a class suppressed. Being male and not androgynous, men will naturally speak in terms of male experience" (4). Shulamith Firestone brands it as "the Male Angle" (168). It fails to recognize that male reality is not the complete reality. It is the myopic tendency to make universal statements on the basis of male experience. It obscures the comprehensive view of reality and the work seems as merely a subjective experience.

The literary misogyny as a concept is not a new phenomenon. It has been continuously present in human experience. From the day of creation, feminine being tended to be secondary to the masculine. According to the popular creation myth, first man was paired with first woman. But the emergence of the first woman follows that of the first man. Eve emerges out of the body of Adam, not Adam out of Eve's. Our mythology serves as the forerunner of literary misogyny in literature. In our religious philosophy, the universe is based on the polarity of the two principles. The masculine principle is "purusha." Purusha means the male or the man. The feminine principle is associated with "Sakti." In the philosophy of yoga, purusha is consciousness while "Sakti" is the female or the maternity. However these two are complementary to each other. The

masculine without Sakti is compared to a lifeless god. The feminine deprived of purusha becomes capricious and dangerous. Feminist vocabulary defines the above cited dichotomy as the patriarchy and the matriarchy. According to the feminist's ideology, the two principals are two rival entities. There is always an opposition or power struggle going on among the two.

Patrocinio P. Schweickart in 'Reading Ourselves: Toward a Feminist theory of Reading'dwells upon the major concerns of feminist criticism till date. According to her in the first phase the principal mode of feminist criticism was 'feminist critique.' It was counter-ideological and concerned with the feminist as reader. Against it, at present the dominant mode of feminist criticism is 'gynocritics' which studies woman as writer, the psychodynamics of female creativity and the evolution of a female literary tradition. Patrocinio raises a pertinent question when she says that role of a woman as reader is as much important as that of woman as writer. There are many important reasons why feminism reveals a connection with another famous theory called reader-response criticism. Both feminism and reader response theory dispute the sacred nature of text and the illusion of objectivity. Both of them recognize the ability of the reader to produce their own meanings, thus giving female the power of agency. It is apparent that with the arrival of feminism the nature of text attains importance. For the feminists how we read is essentially linked with what we read. The feminist entry into the debate begins with realization that the literary canon is androcentric and that it has damaging effect on women readers. Androcentric literature structures the reading experience differently depending upon the gender of the reader. A male reader feels affinity with the universal precisely because he is male.

The difference between feminism, feminity and femaleness is central to understand feminist critique of patriarchal system and how it is instrumental in subverting position of women. Feminine and masculine are social constructs, they represent patterns of sexuality and behaviour modeled by cultural and social norms. Thus in a way, feminine represents nurture and female nature. Toril Moi while explaining the difference calls "feminism as a political position, femaleness as a matter of biology and feminity as a set of culturally defined characteristics" (Kauffman 182). Thus we find that feminism advocates woman's complete equality with man in all spheres of life-political, social, legal, economic etc. and feminist movement is an organized effort for the achievement of equal rights for women. In other words feminist position can be described as a woman's assertive resistance to exploitation of any kind and against her use as an object. Feminism

is a pluralistic movement with diverse aims. As such feminists are usually divided into two categories-liberal and radical. While liberal feminism considers legal equality and equal opportunity with men as the object, radical feminism takes uprooting and replacing all existing social and political institutions as its avowed aim which are responsible for the subjugation of female.

To understand feminism it is imperative to understand some of the terms related with it. 'Politics' is one such term used frequently by feminists. Since feminism is defined as "a specific kind of political discourse, a theoretical and political practice committed to the struggle against patriarchy and sexism"(Benstock 147), the term politics takes different meanings than the ways of government or electoral and is all about power and power relations between man and woman. Concomitantly with politics, feminists use marginal as a position occupied by women in male dominated society. Feminism underscores the belief that men have controlled and created history, politics and culture and in doing so woman is related to the margins of culture.

Males of the human species are biologically distinguished from the females of the same species. The most accepted division is that of the sex or the anatomy of the body. Feminist vocabulary makes use of sex and gender to represent two opposite concepts. A person's sex is determined by anatomy and refers to the biological division of human beings into male and female, while gender is not based on biology or anatomy but entirely on cultural notions inherent in patriarchal civilization. The gender bias is visible in most of the literary works. Also there exists a set of characteristics that are especially considered suitable for the male. In other words they are the qualities that are socially and culturally appropriated as being manly. Manliness is supposed as being strong, virile, brave, resolute and honourable. It is also associated with power and authority. Webster's Dictionary defines the word masculinity as "having qualities regarded as characteristics of man, i.e., strength, vigour, boldness, manliness and virility" (Guralvik 484). All these traits conform to the ideology of manliness or masculinity at large. The other side of the gender is female. Femininity includes a set of characteristics which females are supposed to possess. The dichotomy between masculine and feminine is succinctly brought out by M.H. Abrams: "The masculine in our culture has come to be identified as active, dominating, adventurous, rational, creative; the feminine, by systematic opposition to such traits, has come to be identified as passive, acquiescent, timid, emotional and conventional" (235). The 'masculine' ideology and culture are at the center of even great works of literature written mostly by men. Hence the focus of feminism in the late 1980s

has been on gender discrimination, which, as Elain Showlater points out "reading and writing, by men as well as by women, is marked by gender"(Speaking of Gender 2).

With feminism a feminist critique of masculinity has evolved. It has also defined masculinity, giving new dimensions to manliness. According to feminists, patriarchy is all dominance and matriarchy represents the dominated. The femininity is a set of virtues deliberately imposed upon woman. It serves the interests of patriarchy. In this culture, as Simone de Beauvoir says "one isn't born a woman, one becomes one" (Parshley 295). It is the common concern of the feminist critique to "highlight the images and stereotypes of women in literature, the omissions of and misconceptions about women in literature and the fissures in male constructed history" (Showalter, New Feminist Ctiticism 128). A woman-centered analysis will present the manliness and masculinity as a deformation of the human experience. Patriarchy imposes certain social standards of femininity on all biological females to prove that these standards of femininity are natural. Hence a woman who does not conform to these chosen standards is considered unfeminine and hence unnatural.

Since feminist criticism is a political discourse, the mere fact of being a female does not guarantee a feminist approach. In many works by women we find the precisely same patriarchal stereotypes which feminists strive to combat. Therefore it is a misconception that the very act of describing an experience typical of woman's life is a feminist act. In the patriarchal system women are conditioned in such a way that they imbibe the fundamental principal of patriarchal ideology i.e. male superiority and thus are made to contribute willingly to their subordination to men.

Thus we can conclude that feminist criticism acts in three ways: 1. It unfolds the literary representations of sexual difference. 2. It brings out the ways that literary genres have been shaped by masculine and feminine values 3. It shows the exclusion of female voice from literature, criticism and theory. Hence in nutshell it can be averred that most of the literature written during the last few centuries of human civilization is informed by subtle inversions/deformations of female sensibility and this process has helped in the continuation of their subjugation by claiming humility, subordination and obedience as her natural traits. Herein lies the need to free woman from her stereotypical images so that she can attain self-fulfillment and self-realization. The rise of feminism and a critique of gender formulations under modern feminism provides a way out of the subjugation of females. At the same time there is a need to avoid some of the universalist tendencies inherent in western feminism. What is required is a focus on locality of

feminist concerns by situating females in their immediate surroundings and contexts. It would bring an urgency to the context specific nature of female exploitation and their commodification under varying cultures. Literary misogyny can be challenged not in isolation to the social and political context of female subjugation but in tandem with dissection of diverse structures existing throughout the world.

Works Cited

Abrams, M.H. *A Glossary of Literary Terms.* Prism Books Pvt. Ltd., 1993.

Benstock, Shari, editor. *Feminist Issues in Literary Scholarship.* University of Indiana Press, 1987.

Firestone, Shulamith. *The Dialectic of Sex: The Case for Feminist Revolution.* Bantam, 1971.

Guralvik, David B., editor, *Webster's New World Dictionary of the Americal Language*, IInd College ed. Simon & Schuster, Inc., 1986.

Kauffman, Linda. *Gender and Theory*. Basil Blackwell, 1990.

Parshley, H.M., trans, and editor. *The Second Sex.* Picador Classics, 1988.

Rogers, Katharine M. *Feminist Literary Criticism: Explorations in Theory.* University Press of Kentucky, 1975.

Sharma, K.K., editor. *Feminism and Literature: New Points of View.* K.K. Publications, 1996.

Showalter, Elaine, editor. *Speaking of Gender.* Routledge, 1989.

---. *The New Feminist Criticism: Essays on Women, Literature and Theory*. Pantheon Books, 1983.

Punjabi Folklore/ Music and Orality through Translation

Prof. Neenu Kumar

Abstract: The diversity of India is the result of its cultural history. Embedded in it is the 'folklore' of each culture, with its 'orality.' Folklore goes beyond boundaries. The past of any culture integrates with the future for better understanding due to its 'orality' and 'folklore.' It has to be understood that 'folklore' moves forward with the progress of the civilization by embracing various forms en-route its odyssey through the years. Consequently, it does not remain static, in any 'form,' which might propagate itself as the 'original,' at a given point of time. It has an everlasting effect on modern civilization as if flows unrestrictedly through time. 'Folklore' is not confined to the rural population anymore having become an integral part of the semi-urbane and the urbane. It is not merely confined to the 'orality' of any given culture, as it is passed down but incorporates cultural traditions, discernible etiquette, specific distinctions, emotional reactions, religious leanings and experiences of not just a particular race but also of every person, who lives through it. Each individual has a distinct way of understanding 'folklore' in conformity with her/ his cultural identity and society. The present paper looks at Punjabi Folklore songs in translation. Literal translation cannot do justice to the original unless its essence is captured. Punjabi folk songs have their unique flavour delineating the culture and traditions of Punjab through orality. An attempt will be made to look at different Punjabi songs and their translations and understand if the soul of those songs is captured in them.

Keywords: Folklore, culture, translation, essence, orality.

Introduction

India is a country of diverse 'races, castes, languages, religions, cultures and literatures.' They are clearly different from each other yet are connected at various levels forming a homogeneous whole. The heterogeneous multi-linguality ('*bhashas*') gives India its unique status across the globe. These languages are not restricted to the 'geographical divisions' of a single state; there are 'dialects' within and across the state, with their distinctive characteristics. People have migrated across states/ countries, taking

their culture/ folklore/ music with them, communicating in a 'mixed variety of language/ s.'

"A literary trend in a particular language can go beyond the boundaries of the given language to establish historical, thematic, and stylistic correspondence with literatures in other Indian languages. The *Bhakti* Poetry movement at one time spread across the regional and linguistic barriers of the country. There are writers who speak and write in many languages and readers who understand and enjoy literatures in more than one language. In a single text there can be multilingual situations, or polyphony, or the use of many languages. In the plays of Kalidas Sanskrit, Prakrit, and Magadhi were used with ease and naturalness and the audience could understand and enjoy the linguistic shifts within a single work" (Behera 'Indian Literature, Multiculturalism and Translation').

Punjabi culture/ language/ folklore/ music occupy an important space in this Indian multicultural society. It has always enjoyed an independent status despite it being an integral part of the 'multiplicity' of the many Indian cultures.

Punjabi Folklore/ Music

Punjabi 'folklore/ music,' also known as Punjabi *lok geet*, is the traditional music of Punjab composed by common people. It is accompanied by traditional musical instruments such as the *gagar*, the *ghada* (generally used during the *Gidda* dance performances), the *dhol*, the *kato*, the *sapp* (generally used during the *Bhangra* dance performances), the *tumbi* and many more, which are not only used rarely but are scarcely found in the modern times. Punjabi 'folklore' covers all aspects of life and the myriad emotions associated with it — from birth to death; joys and sorrows associated with life and death; the hard-working nature of the people of Punjab; bravery and heroism of the *Punjabis* (like *Dulla Bhatti*, *Jagga Jat*, *Raja Rasalu*, *Sucha Soorma*, *Shaheed Bhagat Singh*, *Sardar Udham Singh*); love tales of *Heer-Ranjha*, *Sassi-Puunu*, *Sohni-Mahiwal*, *Mirza-Sahibaan*, *Shirin-Farhad*; separation; beauty; marriage like '*Suhag* (related to the bride), *Ghorhian* and *Sehra* (related to the groom), *Sithnian* (ironical statements related to in-laws not meant to be taken seriously); relations and relatives (especially those by a daughter asking her father for a good house and good in-laws); social and economic lifestyles of the people; food; nature; worship ('The sixth Sikh guru, Guru Hargobind, established singers called *Dhadis* to sing the *Gurbani*, *Vaars* (heroic ballads) and other folk genres using the normally two folk instruments, *Dhad* and *Sarangi*'); festivals (like *Lohri*, *Maghi* and *Baisakhi*); *Chhand*; *Jugni*; *Dhola*; *Mahia*; the *Bhangra* and the *Gidda boliyaan* and *tappe*.

Examples

As mentioned earlier, the 'repertoire' of Punjabi 'folklore' is extensive. It is not possible to
do justice to all during the course of this paper. A few examples are taken up to present the flavour of its diversity.

Tappe **on love**, **romance, romantic teasing and fun**

Kothe te aa maayia	*Come to the terrace loved one/ lover*
Milna te aa milne	*Meet if you want to*
Nahin taan khasmaan nu kha maayia	*Or do what you want*

Note: *khasmaan nu kha* is untranslatable.

Ki layna hai mitraan ton	*What can I get from friends/ lovers*
Milan te aa jawan	*I can come to meet you*
Darr lagta ai chiitraan ton	*But I am scared of your slippers/ chappals*

Ethe pyaar di poochh koi na	*There is no regard for love here*
Tere naal nayion bolna	*I will not talk to you*
Tere moonh te moochh koi na	*There is no moustache on your face*

Mazaa pyaar da chakh lavange	*We will taste the joy of love*
Je tera hukm hove	*If you so order*
Moonh te daadi wi rakh lavange	*I will keep beard also on my face*

Baage wich aaya kaaro	*Come to the garden*
Jado asii son jaiyye	*When I go to sleep*
Tusi makhiyaan udaya karo	*Shoo the flies away*

Tusi roz nahaya kaaro	*You take bath everyday*
Makhiyaan to darr de ho	*If you are scared of flies*
Gud thoda khaya karo	*You should eat less jaggery*

Heer

One of the most famous romantic poems is *Heer* by Waris Shah. It is written in **five parts** and has **629 verses**. He talks about the rich and beautiful *Heer*, her love for *Ranjha*, her marriage to another man, *Heer* and *Ranjha's* coming together again, future marriage plans, *Heer's* poisoning by her uncle, her subsequent death and their final separation. It is a tale of unrequited love.

619. ***Ranjha taqt hazaare baraat liaaun gaya***	***Ranjha went to Guru's house to bring wedding procession***
Ranjha ja ke ghar araam kita	*Ranjha went home and rested*
Gandh pheria su wichh baaiyaan de	*Everyone gave permission for marriage*
Saara kodma aaike gird hoiya	*Entire community gathered around*
Baitha painch ho wichh bharjaeaan de	*He sat surrounded by sisters-in-laws*

620. *Siyalaan ne Heer nu maar dena*   *Siyaals will kill Heer*
... Zehar de ke maariye nadhdi nu   *… We will kill the girl/ daughter by*
                                             Poisoning her

621. *Heer di maut di khabar Ranjhe nu deni* *News of Heer's death has to be given to Ranjha*

Heer moyi nu athvaan pehar hoya   *Heer has been dead for eight hours*
Mainu siyallan ne aj bhijwaaya si   *Siyaals (Heer's relatives) sent me the*
news

                                             today

622. *Ranjhe ne aah maari*   *Ranjha sighed*

Ranjhe waang Farhad de aah kaddi   *Ranjha sighed like Farhad*
Jaan gayi su ho hawa si   *Life left like air*

In response to this Amrita Pritam (1919-2005) wrote a poem *Ajj aakhaan Shah nun* (*To Waris Shah/ Today I tell Waris Shah/ I invoke Waris Shah*) in 1948 after the horrors of the partition of 1947.

Ajj akhaan Waras Shah nu   *Today I ask/ tell Waris Shah*
Kiton kabraan wichhon bol!   *Speak from the graves where you lie*!
Te ajj kitab-e-ishq da   *So, from the book of love*
Koi agla varka phol   *Turn the next leaf*!
Ik royi si dhi Punjab di   *A daughter of Punjab cried*
Tu likh-likh maare vaen   *You wrote verses of lament*
Ajj lakhaan dhiyaan rondiyaan   *Today hundreds of daughters cry*
Tainu Waras Shah nu kehan: *They speak to you, O Waris Shah*:

Jugni, a popular 'folklore,' was earlier sung in the praise of God between the 1940s and 1960s by Alam Lohar.

Ae wae Allah waliyaan di Jugni ji   *Jugni is of those who follow Allah*
Ae wae Nabi Paak di Jugni Ji   *Jugni is of the Holy Prophet*
Ae wae Maula Ali wali Jugni Ji   *Jugni is of Ali and His followers*
Ae wae mere Pir di Jugni Ji   *Jugni is of all my saints*
Ae wae saarey saba di Jugni Ji   *Jugni is the spirit of all of His words*

It has since been sung by many with different meanings and connotations.

Dulla Bhatti is said to have saved girls from abduction and slavery. His song is sung on the occasion of the festival of *Lohri*.

Sundar mundriye ho!   *O Pretty girl*! *Ho*!
Tera kaun vichara? *Ho*!   *Who will look after you*? *Ho*!
Dulla Bhatti waala ho!   *Dulla from Bhatti ho*!
Dulle di dhi viyaai ho!   *Dulle's daughter got married ho*!
Saer shakar paayi ho!   *He gave her a kilo of sugar ho*!

Boliyaan are sung in weddings, *Gidda* and *Bhangra*.

Haraa haraa saag chalai da ve	*Green is the saag of chalai*
Main naa jamdi, tan tu kithon viahiya da ve	*If I was not born, you could not have got married*
Main naa jamdi, tan tu kithon viahiya da ve	*If I was not born, you could not have got married*
Mere veer da viaah	*It is my brother's wedding*
Appa dove jaavange	*We will both go*
Chitte dand gulabi bul	*White teeth pink lips*
Kisse ton mang leyavange	*We will borrow from someone*
Chitte dand gulabi bul	*White teeth pink lips*
Kisse ton mang leyavange	*We will borrow from someone*
Bari barsi khatan gaya c	*Bari barsi I went to buy something*
khat k liaunda feeta	*I bought a tape*
mahi mera nikka jiha	*My lover is small*
masa khich k barabar keeta him	*Barely brought to my height by pulling*
Bari barsi khatan geya si,	*Bari barsi I went to buy something*
khat ke liyanda pizza	*I bought a pizza*
bhangra taan sajda	*Bhangra becomes more enjoyable*
je nache munde da jija	*If the groom's brother-in-law dances*

Note: *Bari barsi* is untranslatable.

A couple of popular Punjabi folk songs

Piche piche aunda meri chal vehnda aaein	*Follow me, keep a watch on the route I walked*
Piche piche aunda meri chal vehnda aaein	*Follow me, keep a watch on the route I walked*
Chereeh valaya vekhda aaein	*O turbaned (the one wearing a turban), Keep looking while returning back (home),*
ve mera laung gawacha	*My nose pin is lost*
Nigah marda aaein ve	*Keep a watch out*
mera laung gawacha	*My nose pin is lost*
Kala sha kala	*Black, totally black*
Kala sha kala	*Black totally black*
Mera kala e sardar	
Goriyaan nu dafaa karo	
Main aap tile di taar	
Goriyaan nu dafaa karo	

Theory

It is evident that any translation involves 'negotiation.' In this process, each group "renounces at something else and at the end somebody feels satisfied since one cannot have

everything" (Eco 2003: 6). The translator dawns the mantle of the 'negotiator' and embarks on the journey of translating a text from its original language, keeping in mind the cultural milieu of its birth as also the cultural context of the language it has to be translated into. The translator has to perform another dual purpose: to be able to put the translated version in the academic environment and/ or in the accepted (in this case 'folklore/ music') scene. Hence, it is paramount that a 'translator/ negotiator' is not only aware of the 'facts' but is also cognizant of the 'feelings, values, psychological subtleties, implied wisdom/s, ways of thinking, ideas and views on/ about life' of the people in both the languages. It is, then, a foregone conclusion that the meaning should not change in the translated version.

In theory, it might be true but the ground begins to shake from under the feet of the 'translator/ negotiator' when it comes to actual translation. In the cultural context there is always more than one interpretation of a word/ phrase/ sentence from one language to another. The task becomes excruciatingly challenging: whether to choose the exact meaning or go for the 'shades of meanings' as sensory and emotional responses cannot always be expressed by a 'synonym' but by certain 'culture specific' terms. She/ he has to create a balance between the cultures of both the languages. Then follows the 'dance with the words.' And, like an expert ballerina/ dancer, the 'translator/ negotiator' walks the tight rope of 'ethical obligation' of appreciating the original text. In the view of Umberto Eco "to establish exactly what the author said is an interesting problem, not only from a semantic point of view, but also in terms of jurisprudence" (Eco 3). The 'translator/ negotiator' may come across hindrances. So, "when a given expression has a connotative force it must keep the same force in translation, even at the cost of accepting changes in denotation" (Eco 63). From the point of view of the author he says: "I am not expecting something literally similar to the original… I want to see how the translator has challenged and emulated his source in his own

language" (Eco 4). The 'cultural and linguistic' prowess of the 'translator/ negotiator' comes into play as she/ he has to consider the 'socio-cultural, historical and economic parameters' of both the languages.

In negotiating a translation, the meaning/ message is very important. "Gile (1995) considers it to consist of content and package. The term package is related to the linguistic and peri-linguistic choices made by the [sender] and to 'the physical medium through which they are instantiated' (Gile 1995: 26). In Gile's opinion, in written texts, the package includes words, grammatical structures to which page layout, graphics, are added. What is essential is that the interaction of content and package affects the message as a whole" (Croitoru 2008: 97).

There can be no equivalent to an original. It is, in fact "a chimera" (Bell 1991: 6). In every language there are 'words/ phrases which cannot be translated in another language in poetry, songs, folklore' (Jakobson 1959: 238; Hatim and Munday 2006:10). In such cases the essence, habits, values and 'norms' of the original has to be captured by making extra efforts to present the meaning 'across cultural and linguistic boundaries.' The overt and covert meanings and 'connotations' and 'denotations' have to be considered to give it a holistic meaning. The cultural fissures are "in some way or another bridgeable [thus making translation always possible and in order to achieve this] an important criterion to heed must be Target Text comprehensibility" (Hatim and Munday 15).

Translation of folklore

Translation was considered to be unproblematic; yet, it has left many unanswered questions

in its wake. "How does the translation of folklore texts function? Does it differ from literary translation? Who were the translators? Were they, in former centuries, merchants, sailors, soldiers, hawkers or minstrels, or were they rather scribes, teachers, ministers, or even poets? In other words: were (and are) they educated, semi-educated or uneducated persons? What role do bilingualism or multilingualism play and are multiethnic, bilingual or border regions the typical areas of transfer from one language to another? What about bilingual audiences, bilingual narratives, and code switching? How, on what occasions, and for what audiences was and is a translation undertaken? What methods of translation are applied and what changes made? What levels and elements of the text are adapted to the recipient culture? What is translatable and what is not? And are there significant differences in the translatability of narrative genres?" (Roth 1998: 244). 'These are only some of the questions that need to be asked if we want to gain a deeper understanding of how folklore texts are communicated across linguistic and cultural boundaries' (Dollerup et al. 1984: 263; Michaelis-Jena 1975: 186; Zirnbauer 1975: 205, 208).

We are living in a globalized world. Everyday communication languages are being translated into *lingua franca* for better understanding of the cultures of other countries. It is a matter of great concern that little to no attention has been paid towards translating 'folklore.' Despite this, 'Urban legends' and 'jokes' go beyond boundaries. Hence, it becomes the moral responsibility of a 'folklorist' to translate the 'folklore' of a particular area keeping in mind 'the problems arising from inter-lingual and intercultural communication.' She/ he can create an 'adapted' version of the original, which might be called an 'approximation.'

Translating 'folklore' of a country into the language of a different country, with its 'different cultural environment' is hard. It is "as difficult as rendering the tales of Charles Perrault or Hans Christian Andersen in Chinese or Japanese or the Grimms' *Household Tales* in Indian languages (Carlos 1998). On the other hand, "*The Cut-off Nose* was originally translated from the Indian *Panchtantra* into Persian and then into Arabic; the Syrian rendering was translated into Greek, Hebrew, and Spanish; the Greek version was then translated into Slavic languages, while the Hebrew version was translated into Latin which, in turn, was translated into Italian, Czech, French, English, and German; the German version was then translated into Danish, Dutch, and Icelandic" (Neumann 1999; Roth 252).

Argument

Since folklore [especially Punjabi folklore] was not/ is not/ has not been translated much, I have made a humble attempt to translate a few prevalent *tappe*, *boliyaan*, a small part of *Jugni*, *Heer*, *Dulla Bhatti* and a popular folk song. As can be noticed, the translation does not do justice to the original. In fact, the rhythm, 'orality' and music are lost to the ears. Certain words are untranslatable, adding to the 'translator's' woe.

Conclusion

From the above, an exploratory conclusion can be arrived at. There are clear distinctions between the 'oral' and the 'written/ printed' text; between 'folkloristic' and 'literary communication' (Bogatyrev/ Jakobson 1929; Assmann 1983); between 'globalizing' and 'localizing' means of translation especially related to 'faithful translation and adaptation.' There is division between the 'primary / everyday' and 'secondary/ scholarly/ academic/ artistic translation; between 'synchronic and diachronic' translation; and between the 'first language' and 'chain language translation.'

'Folklore' translation is, indeed, tough. It mainly follows the 'synchronic' pattern and is more 'localized.' The attempt to translate into English fails miserably. The

relocation of accounts, with the migration of people ensures numerous and 'chain' translations.

With the exponential increase in emigration/ immigration of the *Punjabis* across the globe, Punjabi 'folklore/ music' has reached the farthest shores. Bollywood has also been instrumental in popularizing Punjabi folk songs. What is important to note is that 'translation in the realm of literary tradition as literary communication, in the "great tradition," is the one that has been best documented and studied.' A literal translation of 'folklore' is not possible.

However, from the viewpoint of 'folklore,' translation and 'literarization' of folk tales/ songs/ accounts and the translation of 'literarized folk chronicles' is paramount and concrete steps need to be taken towards making Punjabi 'folklore' translatable and enjoyable.

Works Cited

Assmann, Aleida. 1983. "Written Folklore. On the emergence and function of a type of tradition." *Writing and memory*: *Archeology of Literary Communication*. Assmann, Jan/ Hardmeier, Christof (Eds.). Munich. 175-193.

Behera, Guru Charan. (n. d.) "Indian Literature, Multiculturalism and Translation." https://www.ntm.org.in>ttvol>Volume7 https://www.ntm.org.in/download/ttvol/Volume7/ Articles/06%20%20Indian%20Literature,%20Multiculturalism%20and%20Translation%20%20Guru%20Charan%20Behera.pdf

Bell, Roger T. 1991. *Translation and Translating*: *Theory and Practice*. London, New York: Longman 1991.

Bogatyrev, Petr/ Jakobson, Roman. 1929. "Folklore as a special form of creativity." *Donum* [Latin] (*gift/ present*) *natalicium* [Latin] (*birthday party*) *Schrijnen* [Dutch] (*shrines*). Nijmegen [Dutch]: Utrecht. 900-913.

Carlos, S. 1998. "Grimms' Tales in the Indian Narrative Situation." Paper presented at the 12th ISFNR congress in Göttingen, July 1998.

Croitoru, Elena. 2008. "Translation as Cultural Negotiation." *Romanian Journal of English Studies*. ISSN 1584-3734. 94-101.

Dollerup, Cay/ Holbek, Bengt/ Reventlow, Iven/ Rosenberg Hansen, Garsten. 1984. *The Ontological Status*, *the Formative Elements*, *the 'Filters' and Existences of Folktales*. *Fabula*: 25. 241 -265.

Eco, Umberto. 2003. *Mouse or Rat? Translation as Negotiation*. London: Weidenfeld & Nicolson.

Gile, Daniel. 1995. *Basic Concepts and Models for Interpreter and Translator Training*. Amsterdam, Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing.

Hatim, Basil, Munday Jeremy. 2006. *Translation*. London and New York: Routledge

Jakobson, Roman. 1959. "On Linguistic Aspects of Translation." *On Translation*. Reuben Arthur Brower (Ed.). New York: Oxford University Press.

http://folkpunjabisongs.blogspot.com/2018/11/punjabi-wedding-song-kala-sha-kala.html

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Dulla_Bhatti

https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Jugni

https://www.allthelyrics.com/lyrics/jagjit_singh-kothe_te_aa_mahiya

https://www.giddhabhangraboliyan.com/page/2/

https://www.giddhabhangraboliyan.com/page/3/

https://www.livehistoryindia.com/story/living-culture/jugni-punjabi

https://www.mamalisa.com/?t=es&p=6393

https://www.punjabi-kavita.com/HeerWarisShah.php

https://www.punjabi-kavita.com/Lammian-Vatan-Amrita-Pritam.php#Lammian1

https://www.punjabi-kavita.com/Waris-Shah.php (English translation)

http://www.punjablinks.com/boliyan/bari-barsi-boliyan/

https://www.quora.com/What-does-the-Punjabi-song-Mera-Long-Gawacha-most-commonly-sung-during-weddings-mean

Michaelis-Jena, Ruth (with contributions by Ludwig Dcncckc). 1975. "Edgar and John Edward Taylor, the first English translators of the children's and household tales." *Brothers Grimm Commemoration* 2nd ed. Ludwig Dcncckc (Ed.). Marburg. 183-202.

Neumann, Siegfried. 1999. "Nose: The cut off Nose." *Encyclopedia of fairy tales* 9, 3. CD. R. W. Brednich et al. Berlin/New York.

Roth, Klaus. 1998. "Crossing Boundaries: the Translation and Cultural Adaptation of Folk Narratives." *Fabula*: 39. 243-255. https://epub.ub.uni-muenchen.de/17686/1/fabl.1998.39.3-4.243.pdf

Zirnbauer, Heinz. 1975. "Grimm's fairy tales with English eyes. A study of development of the illustration of Grimm's fairy tales in English translation from 1823 to 1970." *Brothers Grimm Commemoration* 2nd ed. Ludwig Dencckc (Ed.). Marburg. 203-242.

An Eco-critical Study of Myth: The Case of Amish's *Shiva Trilogy*

Dr. Shayantani Banerjee
&
Ms. Ayushi Zina

Abstract: The new consciousness that if nature is destroyed, nothing would be left to discourse about has given birth to the eco-critical thought process. The eco-critics do not limit the notion of the world to human beings but stress on its expansion by including the entire ecosphere. This paper would justify how this notion of the world has been expressed in Amish's *Shiva Trilogy*, which not only redefines mythology but also narrates the tales through the ecological world. The paper aims to present that "myths and the literature of nature have been written in acknowledgement and understanding of each other, that they have evolved in parallel, with a common focus on the intervention of human beings in nature." (Junquera, Moreno: 2018) Through the analysis of Shiva Trilogy, this paper would not only highlight the detrimental results of the consequences of human actions on the ecology, the myths bearing a testimony to it, but would also create awareness to contribute to environmental restoration.

Keywords: Nature, eco-criticism, ecology, myth, mythology, destruction, environment, natural,eco-conscious

To triumph over the futility of the modern period where Nature is being objectified and disregarded, writers seek comfort in mythology to reinstate the moral and natural order. Myth as well as literature bears testimony to the relation between humans and the natural world. Junquera and Moreno in their paper entitled, 'Mythology and Ecocriticism: A Natural Encounter' wrote:

> *"... myths and the literature of nature have been written in acknowledgement and understanding of each other that they have evolved in parallel with a common focus on the intervention of human beings in nature"* (2018)

The present article is an ecocritical reading of Amish's 'Shiva Trilogy' with a special focus on his use of myths to raise ecological concerns. The new consciousness that if nature is destroyed, nothing would be left to discourse about, has given birth to the eco-critical thought process. Ecocriticism originated as 'literary ecology' and aimed to analyze texts that raised environmental concerns and studied how literature dealt with the study of

nature. Cheryll Glotfelty in the 'Ecocriticism Reader' (1996) defines ecocriticism as "the study of the relationship between literature and the physical environment", keeping in view the inherent relationship of humans and nature. It explores environmental issues on a literal as well as metaphorical level.

'Shiva Trilogy' as the name suggests, is based on the Hindu God, Lord Shiva and his quest to find evil through the ecological world. The story, derived from myths, intermixes science and myth with the narrative. India is a land of multiculturalism and different conventions and traditions while being highly indebted to nature. Tripathi incorporates this 'Indianness' into the trilogy making it a specimen for an ecocritical reading. "The application of ecology and ecological concepts" (Rueckert, 1978) is clearly evident in the presentation of the various tribes and the Meluhans against the backdrop of the natural world. The magnificence of the ecological world is put across in the opening chapter of the first book, 'The Immortals of Meluha':

"The mighty Jhelum river, a roaring tigress in the mountains, slowed down to the rhythm of a languorous cow as she entered the valley". (Meluha:10)

The languid description of Nature shows how mesmerized Shiva was by the snow-capped mountains, winding rivers, green meadows and the magnificent architecture in the Meluhan Empire. On reaching the valley of Kashmir after marching continuously for four weeks from Tibet, Shiva and his tribal Gunas are deeply struck by the mesmerizing beauty of the natural landscape of Kashmir:

"The vast valley was covered by a lush green canvas of grass… Rows upon rows of flowers arrayed all of God's colors, their brilliance broken only by the soaring Chinar trees, offering a majestic, yet warm Kashmir welcome. The melodious singing of the birds calmed the exhausted ears of Shiva's tribe". (Meluha:10)

Amish's nature writing reveals his love for nature and eco-consciousness. It also shows that environment may not only refer to wilderness but also to cultivated landscapes and cultural interactions with those natural elements.

Amish has woven the story with the ecology to create awareness about the importance of the natural world without which human beings cannot exist and yet how ironically it is the human beings who bring about the destruction of this life-giving source on earth. The story revolves around the mythological god, Lord Shiva and how he is on his quest to find evil and destroy it. He demystifies the mythological tale and makes the characters human. He gives practical explanations to godly incidents and places his characters in the different parts of India. He begins by describing how the Meluhans ask

Shiva and his tribe 'the Gunas' to relocate to Meluha from the foothills of Mount Kailash. The very first chapter unfolds how wars are fought to gain control over natural resources. The neighboring tribes come and kill the people of the Guna tribe as they want to be the sole controllers of the holy river. Once Shiva reaches Meluha, he along with his people are given a drink called the Somras. - The drink of the gods. We are eventually told that for the manufacturing of the Somras, large quantities of water were taken from river Saraswati. This led to water depletion from the great river.

"When Somras was being made for just a few thousand, the amount of Saraswati water used didn't matter. But when we started mass-producing Somras for eight million people, the dynamics changed. The waters started getting depleted slowly by the giant manufacturing facility at Mount Mandar… It's a matter of time before the entire river is completely destroyed." (Meluha: 17-18)

This could be taken as a representative of the concerns of eco-critics. All the elements of life and their interrelationships leading to evolution are ruled by the Natural law. To understand our connections and disconnections with nature, we must, therefore go back to the ancient mythologies, and analyze how these have been presented and adapted in history and literature through the centuries. Rig Veda highlights:

"Rivers occasion widespread destruction if their coasts are damaged or destroyed". (Chakrabarti: 172)

Vedic culture and scriptures present a vivid picture of earth's ecosystems and the necessity for maintaining their balance. Human beings are selfish in their needs and extract as much as they can from the ever- giving nature, leaving it bereft of its grandeur. But he also asserts that nature knows how to take back its power. From time-to-time natural calamities occur which wreak havoc in the lives of human.

"*Then a terrible calamity occurred. The seas rose and destroyed their entire civilization."* (Meluha:183)

As a consequence of taking the Somras Shiva's throat turns blue. The people of Meluha proclaim him to be the Neelkanth, their god. The king of the Meluhans- King Daksha asks Shiva to save them from the Chandravanshis. The Meluhans were the Suryavanshis, that is, followers of the "path of the sun". (Meluha:40) The sun is an object of Nature providing life to all creatures. Like the Sun, the Meluhans (Suryavanshis), were supposed to provide benefits to others without expecting anything in return. They followed strict law and order and codes of hygiene. They had come to believe that Chandravanshis attacked them with the help of the Nagas. As the story proceeds, we see

how Shiva wages a war against the Chandravanshis, only to realise that they were not evil. Amish presents the philosophy of balance. This entire tale has a parallel theme of the ecological concerns which dominate the story. Amish wants to convey to the readers that nature can exist only in balance. He has explained how every being on earth is dependent on the other

"*The plants, animals, objects, our bodies, everything carries and transmits energy. But the biggest carrier of energy that we are in touch is Mother Earth herself- the ground that we walk on."* (Meluha:78)

Dr. Suresh Frederick has opined that "*Ecocriticism is totally opposed to the anthropocentric view, i.e., human-centered view… It supports the biocentric view. The human centered view is beneficial to the humans but the biocentric view is beneficial to both the humans and the biosphere".* (Frederick: 14)

Thus, we find this biocentric view being presented by Amish in his work. In most mythologies we find a glorification of godly characters, or some super human character. In this tale, he demystifies the myth and highlights instead a necessity to preserve the ecosystem we have been blessed with.

Through the character of Shiva, he even goes to the extent of saying that God does not exist in idols. God exists "*in the flow of the river, in the rustle of the trees, in the whisper of the winds".* (Meluha:46)

Myths and legends provide a wide range of scope for inspiration. It serves literature both as a metaphor and allegory. Mythical elements, legends and backdrop of events serve as a huge canvas to portray and project issues of contemporary society like racism, discrimination, injustice, etc. We come across the Nagas in the second book of the trilogy, 'The Secret of Nagas', who are a tribe of people who are born with deformities and suffer all their lives due to physical pain and social discrimination. Due to their physical deformities people considered them to be evil and did not let them be a part of their society. Social injustice is brought to the forefront by the presence of these characters. In this book Amish talks in detail about the repercussions of human activities on the ecology which in turn affects human lives. Shiva undertakes a journey across the entire country to find out the answer to the pertinent question, 'What is evil?'. He makes use of the water route because in those days, water ways was the only viable option for transportation. Throughout the journey he is mesmerized by the soothing presence of water. He remarks that India would never run short of water to which Ganesh replied

"Not if we abuse our rivers the way we are now abusing the Saraswati" (Vayuputras:68)

Atharva Veda warns against dirtying and adding toxic substances into water bodies as "he who dirties or spoils ponds, lakes, rivers, etc," will suffer from dire consequences in the form of diseases. The situation of the mythical Nagas is extremely relevant in the context of the modern civilization which is experiencing an onslaught of ecological diseases due to the pollution of rivers and lakes. The modern human civilization armed by the industrial weapon made arrogant of his scientific knowledge and compelled by the ever-increasing greed for natural achievement is systematically encroaching into the living rights of all other life forms on earth by using, misusing, exploiting and over-exploiting the finite and scarce natural resources of earth. (Manoranjini: 30)

The concept of Deep Ecology devised by Arne Naess in 1972 is in line with this school of thought. Beyond simply studying the relationship between organisms and their environment and making a place for humans in such a relationship, it encourages us to take a moral stand. (Rothenberg,2012). Deep Ecology asserts that a change in human values is essential to preserve the life-giving qualities of our biosphere. Amish, in sync, with the philosophy of Deep Ecology, promotes a lifestyle that seeks to harmonize with nature.

In the second book, Amish also acknowledges the special relevance of forests to the preservation of Nature. As Robert Pogue Harrison has argued:

"Ecological concerns over forests goes beyond just the forests in so far as forests have now become metonymies for the earth as a whole. What is true for a particular forest's ecosystem is true for the totality of the biosphere. Humanity begins to appear in a new light: as species caught in the delicate and diverse web of a forest-like planetary environment. More precisely, we are beginning to appear to ourselves as a species of parasite which threatens to destroy the hosting organism as a whole." (199)

The Queen of the Nagas- Kali takes Shiva to Panchavati, the land where they were forced to live, away from others. While on their journey Kali remarks,

"The forest can be abundant and caring like an indulgent mother if we follow rules. But stray out of line and she can be a demon who will strike you down." (Nagas: 335)

The line aptly captures the essence of the world of nature. Human beings should respect mother Nature and follow the rules of sustenance. Once they start exploiting the ecological world for their greed, it ceases to be a mother and becomes a demon instead. In

this book we are told about the problem of people belonging to a place called-Branga. A plague had hit Branga because of which people were dying and children were suffering. Shiva tries to find answers to the suffering of these people.

It is only in the third book – 'The Oath of the Vayuputras' that we find answers to the plague of the Brangas and the deformities of the Nagas- the Somras, a boon and a curse at the same time. The Nagas were in fact created by the Somras. Excess consumption led to cancer or deformities in the off-spring. The Meluhans had been consuming Somras all their lives. Somras made people immortal but in turn it caused problems in the off-springs of the consumers. The plague of Brangas was, thus, directly linked to the misuse of the ecological world. The manufacturing of Somras was creating a lot of toxic waste which needed to be disposed. The scientists of Meluha were releasing the toxic waste in the water bodies which was then reaching the land of the Brangas and poisoning them.

"*Though the Branga children also suffer from the same body-wracking pain as the Nagas, they are free from deformities. Sadly, Branga also has a high incidence of cancer.*" (Vayuputras: 21)

Thus, by creating Somras, people were extracting huge amount of wood and water from the ecological world, and in return supplying poison to the ecosystem. Ultimately this poison was affecting the humans.

Hence the modern man needs to re-establish his broken link with nature and with life. Amish, uses the concepts of 'Good' and 'Evil' as ways of life for every living entity. Good and evil make dialectical pairs with creation and destruction and balance and imbalance. The cosmos is the balancing force between good and evil. Any good (Somras) enjoyed excessively is counteracted by the creation of the evil by the universe carrying the intrinsic quality to re-balance itself.

Eco critics have opined that of all the literary theories, it is only ecocriticism which deals with this practically visible topic of concern. The ecological world exists outside of us. It is a real entity which is being destroyed. The destruction of this prime source of life, needs to be voiced. The other theories, like, postmodernism, structuralism, post-structuralism, derived these ideologies through linguistics or the social-cultural background, whereas eco-critics emphasize that nature exists as a force which affects our lives on a day-today basis.

The myths of paradise lost and recovered have inspired contemporary writers like Amish Tripathi who, rather than lamenting the loss of wilderness, look forward to its

transformation into farmed landscapes and aspire for a symbiotic relationship between human and nature. He has rekindled the hope that like the ancient myths, such works and studies will inspire action responding optimistically and realistically to the current environmental crisis, paving way for the "recovery of paradise lost". (Junquera & Moreno, 2018)

Works Cited

Chakrabarti, Ranjan, ed., *Critical Themes in Environmental History of India*. Sage, 2020.

Frederick, Suresh. 'Interspecific Relationship in the Select Poems of Charles Harpur'. Balachandran. K. ed. *Critical Essays on Australian Literature*. Arise Publishers & Distributors, 2010.

Glotfelty, Cheryll and Fromm, Harold, eds. *The Ecocriticism Reader: Landmarks in Literary Ecology*. University of Georgia Press, 1996.

Harrison, Robert Pogue. *Forests: The Shadow of Civilization*. The University of Chicago Press, 1992.

Junquera, Imelda Martin and Moreno, Fransisco Molina. 'Mythology and Ecocriticism: A Natural Encounter'. *Ecozon*, Vol. 9:2, 2018.

Manoranjini. T. 'Conflicts between Nature and Man as socio-Cultural Being in Amish Tripathi's Shiva Triology'. In *Language in India*, Vol. 19:3, 2019.

Rothenberg, David. 'Deep Ecology'. Chadwick, Ruth, ed. *Encyclopedia of Applied Ethics*. USA: Academic Press, 2011.

Rueckert, William. 'Literature and Ecology: An Experiment in Ecocriticism'. In *Iowa Review* 9, no. 1, 1978, pp. 71 -86.

Tripathi, Amish. *The Immortals of Meluha*. Westland, 2010.

Tripathi, Amish. *The Secret of the Nagas.* Westland, 2010.

Tripathi, Amish. *The Oath of the Vayuputras.* Westland, 2010.

Feminism in Lawrence's Lady Chatterley's Lover

Pratiksha Dixit
&
Chaya Malviya

Abstract: Lady Chatterley's Lover, the last work of D.H. Lawrence was lauded as a great achievement in the portrayal of tender love as the foundation of an emotionally satisfying life for men and women, especially after the 1960 trial. The novel started getting critical attention after 1970 from the famous feminist critics. A thinly disguised patriarchal ideology, as endorsing only the male-centered view of sexuality and heterosexual relationship as the only emotionally satisfying sexual preference was perceived by them in the novel. Womanhood means   seeking pleasure and mothering as the only means of emotional fulfillment has also attracted attention of some critics. The current study intends to throw light on the novel from psychoanalytic feministic perspective with the view that since Lawrence spoke openly against British mainstream culture, especially presenting in his novels a clear and direct criticism of the prevalent colonial and capitalistic outlook and the prejudice of the capitalist class against English working class people, he does stand for women's freedom as well, and therefore, a patriarchal ideology is not endorsed by him. Thus, the present study is a modest attempt to show that the feminist reading of Lawrence's novels, especially of Lady Chatterley's Lover, is certainly a misreading which doesn't take into account Lawrence's views on the capitalistic industrialistic world, the world torn apart through World War I and his anticipation of the stress on the unconscious, the body and the irrational motives in various areas of contemporary criticism. The present study, through a critical reading of the novel from the psychoanalytic and feminist perspective, arrives at the conclusion that Lady Chatterley's Lover is an attempt to search a solution to the issues related to man-woman relationship which Lawrence felt, had gone completely out of focus and thus scattered.

Introduction

Lady Chatterley's Lover the novel written by D. H. Lawrence's published in 1928-29, caused huge controversy and attracted criticism for the next forty years. This novel was written as a critique on the calamitous and devastating effects of the First World War

and newly inducted industrial revolution on the psycostate of Clifford, the husband of Lady Chatterley. Representing the changing landscape of British society, while advocating the right to sexual freedom and desire, *Lady Chatterley's Lover* undergoes a transformation of interpretation. Since this novel violets the set rules of that time civic and social societies, the novel was banned after the first publication in Italy in 1928. Lady Chatterley's Lover was so controversial that when Penguin Books published it in 1960 to mark thirtieth death anniversary of D. H. Lawrence's, the publication was declared illegal and the Penguin Books company had to face one of the most famous obscenity trials of the twentieth century.

Lawrence was troubled by humanity's excessive relationship with its mental consciousness. He determined two basic consciousnesses in humans: one stemming from the intellect and the other from the body itself. Forms of government, cultural traditions, laws, and religions come under the first category i.e. mental consciousness. The second category comprising blood consciousness, deals with instincts and emotions, aspects of humanity which in the opinion of Lawrence was neglected. Lawrence severely criticizes the preference of humankind for customs that violates the very nature of humans, such as the logic of obscene words for natural bodily functions.[1]

Lawrence has also shown his strong awareness of feminism and mental consciousness in his novel *Lady Chatterley's Lover* by exploring the relationship between woman and man, woman and nature and man and man. This was expressed in his lines "As Connie Chatterley drives through Tevershall-where her husband runs the mine and where most who work there live-she observes the state of the people, who are representative of the England of today" (LCL, 153). She wonders, "Ah God, what has man done to man? What are the leaders of men doing to their fellowmen? They have reduced them to less than humanness, and now there can be no fellowship any more! It is just a nightmare"(ibid.).[2]

Feminism in Lady Chatterley's Lover

The oppression and struggle of women for love, sex and freedom were presented by Lawrence in the novel *Lady Chatterley's Lover*. Janice H. Harris mentioned that Lawrence was the supporter of woman's liberation through the recognition of her sexual self." (Janice, 1990, p.70).[3] According to Bridget Pugh, *Lady Chatterley's Lovers* embodies Lawrence's statement about a negation of the power-urge as industrialism similar to his theories in "*Lawrence and Industrial symbolism*".[4] The men and women relationship is one of the most prominent themes in Lawrence's works. According to him

it is not only the harmony of the natural world which is ruined by the industrialization, but also the harmony of the human world is broken up. "But didn't you say the other day that you were a conservative-anarchist,"she asked innocently. "And did you understand what I meant?" he retorted. "All I meant is, people can be what they like and feel what they like and do what they like, strictly privately, so long as they keep the form of life intact, and apparatus." (Lawrence, 2009, p.193) From the above conversation we can feel Clifford's superiority to the working class in industrialization and his cruel treatment to them. Clifford is depicted by Lawrence, as a representative of the ruling class, who is selfish ,ugly, cruel, heartless and greedy half-man, even a half-machine monster, fully demonstrating Lawrence's hatred to industrialization that results in alienation of human beings.[2]

In Lady Chatterley's Lover, Clifford Chatterley's is shown as a typical victim of industrialization with his humanity being alienated. He is wealthy and enjoys a high social status for being the owner of real estate and coal-mine. Unfortunately, he never stops pursuing money, fame and social position in his life. Being deeply under the influence of the capitalist industrialization, he gets his larger profits from the mining industry, treating the miners cruelly. After he comes back from the war, Clifford has become crippled and impotent which makes him unable to have a child. Felling of being surrounded by the power and money reduced his inferiority caused by disablity and male sexual dysfunction.[5] In that scenario Clifford was considered a modern man as he believed in the process of industrialization. Eventually his physical paralysis affected his psycostate as influenced by the highly industrialized world he lived in. In Lawrence words "The gay excitement had gone out of the war...dead. A man needed support and comfort. A man needed a wife" (Lawrence, 2009, p.8)[2]. So, Clifford chooses to marry after losing his male power, as he wanted to get rid of his spiritual emptiness. He belived that in his married life sex is not an important part, contrasting the Lawrence's viewpoint that for maintaining a harmonious relationship between men and women sex is an utmost necessicity and the key for a their relationship. This has been the reason that Clifford's asexual marriage finally became a tragedy.

Clifford being fragile by his paralysis rendered him alienated and motionless. In his opinion sex is just a "habit" of a couple which could only promote the mental intimacy between men and women. "We have the habit of each other and habit, to this thinking, is more vital than any occasional excitement." (Lawrence, 2009, p.46)[2]

Clifford turned his attention to the coal-mine industry, making money for escaping from his inferiority as a disabled husband. His disaffection is not only externalized in his married life, but he also became cruel towards working class. His greed was only to make profit from the coal-mining industry by squeezing every drop of productivity from the miners. This lead to dissatisfaction among workers and strikes. Heated disagreements and arguments between the couple for Clifford's cold and heartless attitude became a routine which gradually increased the distance between Clifford and Connie. Clifford had poor mentality in spite of being rich materially. He tends to show off when he got his reputation, wealth and power as a modern industrialist, in order to hide his poor spirit. However, his such senseless concealing is doomed to failure.[6] "The wallowing in private emotion, the utter abasement of his manly self, seemed to lend him a second nature, cold, almost visionary, business-clever. In business he was quite inhuman." (Lawrence, 2009,p.304) [2]

Clifford is no doubt only the poor victim of industrialization physically and mentally. Lawrence makes every effort to criticize industrialization, showing his deep concern about the human being Lawrence criticizes the tragic influence of industrialization on both body and soul of humans. And the only solution to their getting back unconscious and instinctual self is to return to nature, providing with human energy to recover from the frustrating reality, which is like the pregnant mother giving nutriments to her baby. The healing effect of nature is therefore strongly evident and Lawrence himself is optimistic and hopeful for that. As he said once "It is rather hard work: there is now no smooth road into the future. But we go round, scramble over the obstacle. We've got to live, no matter how many skies have fallen" (Lawrence, 2009, p.1)[2]

Connie is soaked in her dull and lifeless life in Wragby. She can feel the essence of life only after she returns to the wild world. Connie identity is established by means of satisfying her sexual desire. A significant role is played by Mellors in establishing Connie's identity. The passionate relationship between Connie and Oliver Mellors, Cliffords gamekeeper, represents the possible solution for the country, one that is so ashamed of the body and is in touch with the blood consciousness. David Kellogg writes, "the relationship of Connie and Mellors is clearly represented as resistant to socialized forms of sexuality, including those of other characters in the novel and thus as inclined toward a natural sexual expression." [5] The couple's relationship was not influenced by their mental consciousness, rather, they listen to their blood consciousness, their instincts in

his essay, "A Propos of Lady Chatterley's Lover, Lawrence writes, But I stick to my book and my position :Life is only bearable when the mind and the body are in harmony, and there is a natural balance between the two, and each has a natural respect for the other. And it is obvious, there is no balance and no harmony now" (LCL, 310)

What has gone wrong between Connie and Clifford can certainly be misinterpreted by the reader. Connie is unable to have a sexual relationship with her wheelchair bound husband. Lawrence highlights the war wounds of Clifford, who had been paralyzed during the Great War, instead of placing the blame of the marriage's ills solely on Connie-who needs physical fulfillment of some kind,perhaps just physical touch.[8] The narrator notes "that when the emotional soul receives a wounding shock, which does not kill the body, the soul seems to recover as the body recovers. But this is only appearance. It is, really, only the mechanism of assumed habit. Slowly, the wound to the soul begins to make itself felt... till it fills all the psyche" (LCL, 49)[2]. Clifford has not really overcome from the horrors of war and is emotionally cold. His system had undergone such a great shock that his emotional self is shut off. This is the reason for his inability to connect with Connie, not because he is impotent Their relationship has been regulated to one functioning only in the unfeeling mental realm instead of fulfilling both of the human consciousnesses. The couple goes through the motions with "a habit of intimacy" (LCL, 50)[9].

Connie's innermost sexual desire is aroused with the appearance of Mellors. The harmonious sexual relationship is an indispensable part in human beings.[10] There is some descriptions in the novel about Connie's awaking self-consciousness: " She had come to the real bedrock of her nature, and was essentially shameless. She was her sensual self, naked and unashamed. She felt a triumph, almost vain glory. So! That was how it was! That was life! That was how one really was! There was nothing left to disguise or to be ashamed of. (Lawrence, 2009, p. 245)[2] Connie achieves her individuality as a woman. She has the qualities of intelligence,independence and courage of changing are possessed by her. Connie is brave enough to fight against injustice and pursue her equality, security and happiness in a patriarchal society. These are the reflections of her eco-feminist, struggling for the equality and freedom.She is saved both physically and mentally from the dull and empty married life and finally constructs her own identity by her bold pursuing for love.[11]

D.H. Lawrence in Lady Chatterley's Lover suggests that women form their identity through men. "If men fail to be men, then women will not be able to be

women."In D. H. Lawrence's vision of the two sexes, women are fundamentally passive. Being active destroys their essential femininity.

Works Cited

Chapter VI, "First Glimmerings of Mind," in Fantasia of the Unconscious in FUPU and "A Propos of Lady Chatterley's Lover" LCL, 311.

Lawrence, D. H. (2009). Lady Chatterley's Lover. Penguin Books

Harris, Janice H. (1990). Lawrence and the Edwardian Feminists, The University of Wisconsin Press.

Pugh, B. (1989). The Midlands Imagination: Arnold Bennett, George Eliot, William Hale White and D. H. Lawrence. In: Preston, P., Hoare, P. (eds) D.H. Lawrence in the Modern World. Palgrave Macmillan.

David Kellogg, "Reading Foucault Reading Lawrence: Body, Voice, Sexuality in Lady Chatterley's Lover, D. H. Lawrence Review 28, 3 (1999), 41.

Michel Foucault, Security, Territory, Population: Lectures at the College de France, 1977-1978, ed. Michel Senellart and trans. Graham Burchell Palgrave Macmillan, 2009, 1.

Andrew Keese, "Hybridity and the Postcolonial Solution in D. H. Lawrence's T Plumed Serpent," in D. H. Lawrence: New Critical Perspectives and Cultural Translation, ed. Simonetta de Filippis Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2016, 199.

David Ellis, D. H. Lawrence: Dying Game, 1922-1930 Cambridge University Press, 1998, 396-9.

Aldous Huxley, "The Censor," in The Critical Response to D. H. Lawrence, ed. Jam Pilditch Westport, Greenwood Press, 2001, 169.

Susan Merrill Squier, Babies in Bottles: Twentieth-Century Visions of Reproductive Technology Rutgers University Press, 1994, 29-55.

Acceptance, embracement and reflexively enduring the status of being: Revisiting Odisha through Jayanta Mahapatra's 'Dawn at Puri'

Mohana Das
&
Dr. Madhurima Mukhopadhyay

Abstract: Jayanta Mahapatra is well-known in all Indian English literary history. His poems are highly sensitive, that seek to represent incredible India. Most of his poems amalgamate history, sociology, and spirituality. Similarly, Dawn at Puri becomes an exemplary attempt to revisit Orissa with a wide range of emotions. His choice of words brings opacity to writing. The simple narrative style brings a closer interaction with an audience of all age groups in India. Besides, it argues with the people's lack of connection with nature and self. Lastly, the intention brings the embracement among people that readers may feel even in the absence-presence of Orissa through reading. The first Indian English poet to be awarded the prestigious Sahitya Akademi Award, Mahapatra's poem, *Dawn at Puri* becomes an exciting interpretation of Indian couture. Mahapatra's connection with English poetry can be termed as a series of dreams dressed in elegance and beautiful language. *Dawn at Puri* is often sought to harbor similar pious virtues and values of people. From allowing readers to travel through Orissa, he introduces the sentiments, culture, and spiritual indignation through the eastern coastal region of India. The city of Puri is reverent superficially and can be seemed forlorn, as its citizens are joyless and hungry. It has been described as a group of homogenous women who have generally gathered to worship. The speaker was hoping for some different kind of redemption in such a wayward world and the such reason is described through the poem muses- *'Perhaps the piece of driftwood/ washed up on the beach/ heals the sand and the water'.* To conclude, apart from cultural and social homogeneity in literature, there needs to be personal homogeneity that will allow one to find pride in one's differences apart from the acquired attributes like faith, nationality, language, and others. Personal homogeneity and valorization of identity will foster a society where individuals will look beyond ethnic and cultural similarities but 'homogeneity of thought'.

Keywords: Embracement, culture, reason, acceptance, identity

Introduction

"[India is] the One land that all men desire to see, and having seen once, by even a glimpse, would not give that glimpse for all the shows of all the rest of the globe combined." – Mark Twain

Jayanta Mahapatra was born on October 22, 1928. His parents did not belong from an affluent. He received early formal education at the Stewart Institution in Cuttack. He was a meticulous student and had a creative bent of mind. Gradually, in 1949, Mahapatra completed his master's degree in physics. Later on, he began working as a teacher and taught in many Government institutions in Orissa, India. He retired from his profession in 1986. His creative achievements came at a later stage as he began composing poetry at the age of thirty-eight. However, his creative works distinguished him from his contemporaries. They made him acclaimed as one of the pioneers of Indian English poetry. He was known by popular literary figures like A.K Ramanujan and Nissim Ezekiel.

Mahapatra's poem, *Dawn at Puri* is short yet captivating. It conforms to the poem's standard style and brevity. Beautifully, it captures Odisha's history, people, and culture using simple diction. Readers are taken aback by the subcontinent's rich culture and heritage. However, amidst the rich diversity of people and thinking, there lie disturbing social calculations. The proper exercise of embracement and acceptance of self will heal from 'normative imposition' or 'imposed identity. The two powerful tools (embracement and acceptance) set an allowance to embrace all aspects of oneself, both good and bad.

Tracing chaos and disturbing social calculations through the poem

The popular poet of Cuttack, Jayanta Mahapatra received several important accolades for his outstanding literary works. One of the prestigious awards apart from Sahitya Akademi is the Jacob Glatstein Memorial Award in 1975. There are two important prestigious named Allen Tate Prize (2009) and the Padma Shree Award (2009) awarded to Mahapatra. Besides, due to his creativity and distinguished writing style, Mahapatra was conferred an honorary doctorate by Ravenshaw University. Strikingly, his writing became his power and recognition. It not only made him popular among the literary canon but allowed the Indian Landscape to outshine the global paradigm. India is a land of diverse cultures, people, spirituality, cuisine, and varied languages. However, along with the difference it promotes solidarity and unity. Each state embraces these

differences and identifies itself as India.

Dawn at Puri opens with the unending noises of crows, which allows the audience to connect with nature. Amidst everyday activities, an individual dissociates himself/herself from nature. Mahapatra fills that void between humans and the natural world. All his poems allow a re-entering of the natural world and celebrate its beauty with birds, water bodies, trees, animals, and others. Next, the readers visit a Hindu temple:

"White-clad widowed Women

past the centers of their lives

are waiting to enter the Great Temple"

The temple is situated on the bank of a river named Mahanadi. It is where the numerous crows are making noise and in search of food for sustenance. Their noses are not pleasant instead it creates an atmosphere of awe. Later on, it indicates the presence of a dead body that seems to be of great importance to people. There are certain sets of rites and rituals following the demise of a person. With the gradual understanding of the tone of the crow, the readers can connect with the sad and unpleasant atmosphere represented by a skull in the holy sands". The dead body is burnt to ashes and people to wish for the soul's fulfillment perform religious rites that are inclusive of money, food, and other valuables. While India is struggling with hunger and poverty, people need to overcome food waste and false superstitions.

The holy here represents the temple and the sacred river. To perform the rites and rituals, the people have come to pay a visit to the temple. It foregrounds the customs and culture of India. For Mahapatra, these social and religious customs become ironic because during cremation nothing is left except the ashes and memories. On the other hand, the skull symbolizes the hollowness of rites and rituals which holds prejudices, rigidity, and remorse. Here, through the state of Orissa, Mahapatra is attempting to symbolize India. The religious rites and rituals followed after death are synonymous with all cultures in India. The diverse land is known for its religious offerings and beliefs. The diversity that India possesses is dynamic and of huge potential. Even though there are differences in different cultures, people along with the differences are represented as Indian. Through the solitary pyre, Mahapatra represents spiritual obedience over the loss of a person. Indian follow an unwavering trust in God. Death is associated with pain and remorse. Also, it is subjected to gender discrimination, as "*White-clad widowed Women pass the centers of their lives"*. Patriarchy sets women to wear white sarees and follow the customs of being a widow in the absence of a husband. Woman after their husband's death has to

follow rigid customs.

In India, women are associated with patriarchal culture, and widows tend to be particularly marginalized. The incinerated bodies still retain their skulls. However, the complete skull represents spiritual disability and extreme poverty. Certain stereotypical ideas have affected the lives of women for a long time. Society negates her from having any extraordinary talents or qualities. It is the greatest flaw of society to fail to differentiate between gender and sex. Another important point that Beauvoir marks are that society chooses male attributes as the standards of measuring qualities. For this reason, society claims that women are the flawed version of the male or the second sex. They are inferior to the male, and the male is considered to be the superior one, the perfect version. "One is not born but rather becomes a woman," these most quoted words of "The Second Sex" (1949) became the center of the first wave of feminism and the signature of their author Simone de Beauvoir. The skull symbolizes the hollowness of existence that a woman experiences after the death of her husband. Therefore, a woman is remarked to be subordinate to a man. The skull represented the spiritual stagnation that a woman faces after her husband's death. There is a hollowness in thinking that has been ridiculed by Mahapatra constantly through 'into the smoky blaze of a sullen solitary pyre' and

'The fail early light catches

ruined, leprous shells leaning against one another,

a mass of crouched faces without names

Therefore, he allows the reader to think deeper and find concerns like poverty and hunger that are constantly rising in the nation. The skull represents the lack of unproductive thinking while the crow who is searching for food for existence represents the marginalized or underprivileged. While there are people who are believing false superstitions that are to blame for the country's poor progress need to be interrogated. Therefore, the poem becomes paradoxical through the crow cawing that is mirroring hunger and a sequence of food waste. Readers need to interrogate their actions and bring a change in thought. Each individual need to contribute to a social cause that will bring growth with development.

Valorising acceptance of culture and traditions through rational lenses

White-clad widowed Women

past the centers of their lives

are waiting to enter the Great Temple

Their austere eyes

stare like those caught in a net

hanging by the dawn's shining strands of faith.

Dawn at Puri, Lines 4-9

Apart from cultural and social homogeneity in literature, there needs to be personal homogeneity that will allow one to find pride in one's differences apart from the acquired attributes like faith, nationality, language, and others. Personal homogeneity will foster a society where individuals will look beyond ethnic and cultural similarities but 'homogeneity of thought'. To make homogenous thought consistent throughout each irrespective of external differences fundamentally accept the other as 'embodiment'. This embodiment may have variation or diversity but will delimit humanism. The idea behind 'identity' has occupied various researchers, thinkers, and philosophers for centuries.

The speaker is wishing for a different kind of redemption in such a fast-pacing and tough world and such reason is described through the poem muses- *'Perhaps the piece if driftwood/ washed up on the beach/ heals the sand and the water'.* But in reality, after the death of a husband, a woman has no proper salvation. Mahapatra refers to the eyes of the widowed women as austere. It signifies that the husband is the center of any desire or worldly pleasure. The women after the death of their husbands are giving up their identity and otherworldly lives. The austere eyes stare being desireless. The women seem to have been caught in net false superstitions and ideologies. While abiding by the strict cultural codes and deformed ideas, a woman is succumbing to the symbolic net of the patriarchy. It distorts their true identity and approves of subordination. Like a trapped bird or the lost crow who is only in search of food, a woman has lost the freedom of thinking and identify one's true meaning of existence.

The women are depicted as "past the center of their life". The word past may work on implying the large number of time these women dedicated to their husbands. The word 'center' denotes the subordination of a woman to a man. The widows have nothing more to lose as they stand for conducting their spiritual submission. The force that anchors these women is their undying faith in God. The poet further refers to these faces as a group of crouched faces with no individuality. Women are linked with a patriarchal society and the marginalization appears to be pronounced in the case of widows. A recurrent challenge in the literary field is how identity can be maintained beyond social limitations and acceptance. The argument revolved around the possibility of sameness in a sense of self and not others. Individual moves through a perpetual change based on experiences, learning, and interests. An identity is formed from accepting oneself and experiences

gathered from the power of logic and rationality. Discovering the truth of true living independently and exercising freedom will allow us to act and think without delimitation. One needs to accept, embrace and reflexively endure the status of being.

'Dawn at Puri,' successfully depicts a poem that celebrates the landscape a people of Odisha along with the unidentified social disturbing calculations. Apart from being a gorgeous depiction of the seaside, diverse people, and customs, it depicts the hollowness resulting in solitude among people. Just like the crow looking for its food for sustenance, people are looking for their existence. For women, it is difficult to break the shallowness of patriarchy and lie up to one's desire. However, to be free, one needs to deny false superstitions, and disturbing social calculations and identify freedom. To be considered 'social' an individual falls under a label that is distinguished by rules and parameters. On the other hand, the latter 'personal' allow an individual to stay united with his/her characteristic features or attributes that might not fall under social rules. Personal identity will form a special pride and acceptance of self. Individuals together form a community that gives way to a higher being- society. The accumulation of different kinds of individuals falling under social and personal categories are socially consequential. But the argument remains if the unchangeable society can be malleable for letting an individual live with self-respect or dignity even beyond social parameters.

Works Cited

Alexander, M. (1983). Jayanta Mahapatra: A Poetry of Decreation. *The Journal of Commonwealth Literature*, *18*(1), 42-47.

Bai, Kasturi. "Contemporary Abuses and the Need for Edifying Generality: A Study of Jayanta Mahapatra's Poem." The Indian Imagination of Jayanta Mahapatra. . Ed. Jayadeep Sarangi, Gauri Shankar Jha. Delhi: Sarup and Sons, 2006.

Bajaj, R. (2021). Unit-2 AK Ramanujan and Jayanta Mahapatra. Indira Gandhi National Open University, New Delhi.

Beg, M. S. (2017). The Poetry Of Jayanta Mahapatra: A Post-Colonial Proposition. *International Journal of Pure and Applied Researches*, *1*(1).

Deshraj, Anupama, Deshraj. "Ingenuity and Indianness in the Works of Jayanta Mahapatra and Arun Kolatkar." *The Criterion: An International Journal in English*. III.IV. (2012) 2-6.

Sarkar, G., & Sarkar, S. "The sky grow lonelier with cloudlessness": An Exploration of Alienation in the Select poems of Jayanta Mahapatra.

Neither In nor Out: Theorizing the Entangled Space in the Feature Film *Akatho Puratho*

Nithya K. Gopi, **Navaneetha Suresh**,
and **Rayson K. Alex**

Abstract: The landscapes and every emotion humans interact with, has been conceptualized as akam and puram according to tinai. In this paper we attempt to find an entangled space between akam and puram, an overlapping space where the living beings and nonliving things encounter life-altering events, ergo altering the equipoise crucial for life to exist. We argue that the constant interaction between the akam and puram counter parts alleviate their strict boundaries, facilitating energy flow, identity transitions and eventually disturbing the balance between akam and puram counter parts. The akam and puram entanglement is not just an overlap of two parallel sectors; rather it is a more complex process where life forms, environment, culture, emotions and energy intersect where degradation and regeneration happen. Akatho Puratho a portmanteau film directed by Sudevan Peringodu, slowly and engagingly uncovers this entanglement to its complexity**.**

Keywords: tinai, akam and puram, entanglement, and feature film.

Introduction

"Place," is generally understood as any human-appropriated space that is namable, and attains greater meaning "through human action, through dwelling, through emotional attachments, through events, and through memories …" (Nairn and Kraftl ix). Space is understood in a larger canvas where all organisms exist on a surface that contains all natural and social happenings (Nairn and Kraftl 4). The abstractness of the concept of space beneficially brings into purview the diversity of beings on the surface of the earth, the unappropriated landscapes, mindscapes, and the environment. Since places are identified spaces, the overlapping areas, particularly, are entangled in the "socialization of space and the spatialization of society" (Nairn and Kraftl 4). The essay will theorize the entangled spaces of the relationships between humans, other organisms, cultural artifacts, mental states, and the environments in the film, *Akatho Puratho* through the framework of the concept of *akam* (interior) and *puram* (exterior) in *tinai*. *Tinai* is a traditional concept that explicitly describes such aforementioned entangled spaces through its cultural and natural features of specific types of landscapes and the plants, birds, animals, and humans that are dependent on them.

Tinai is an integration of humans and the natural environments so much so that

every aspect of human life is developed with regard to the environment they are living in (Selvamony 215). The concepts of *akam* and *puram* of *tinai* theorize the conflict/integration/politics of the interior and the exterior spaces. Every human emotion and landscape we interact with, have been conceptualized as *akam* and *puram*. Martha Selby in her work, *Tamil Geographies* notes that she "prefers to visualize *akam* and *puram* as two parallel systems with components that often intersect. These intersections blur, and at times, … even erase lines between these distinctions" (19). In this essay, we analyze the Malayalam feature film, *Akatho Puratho* (2018)—a portmanteau film—directed by Sudevan Peringodu, under the banner of Pace Productions. We attempt to find an entangled space between the *akam* and *puram,* an overlapping space where the living and nonliving beings encounter life-altering events, ergo altering the equipoise crucial for life to exist. Here, the entanglement is identified in the space where *akam* and *puram* boundaries blur, cross each other, the transition takes place and permeates. By analyzing the theme, and technicalities that are part of the anthology, we argue that the constant interactions between the *akam* and *puram* counterparts alleviate their strict boundaries, facilitating energy flow, identity transitions and eventually disturbing the balance between *akam* and *puram* counterparts.

Finding the *Akam* and *Puram* in *Akatho Puratho*

The majority of actors in the film are selected from Sudevan's native place Peringode, who are inexperienced and untrained actors (Harikumar). *Akatho Puratho* is an anthology film comprising four parts titled "Malsyam" (Fish), "Paava" (The Doll), "Vridhan" (Old Man), and "Aval" (She). Even though these four parts portray distinctive themes such as love, life, survival, death, interdependency; some of the themes are common in each. The story of the first part, "Malsyam" (Fish) is centered around a fish which is presented as a predator (of water insects, weeds) and also a prey (to other living beings like humans, ants, cat). "Paava" (The Doll) is a symbolic story where the doll represents a family and how the value of non-living beings changes according to the context shown in the film. "Vridhan" (Old man) is shown from the perspective of a bedridden old man. Though the old man is never shown in the film, the whole story depends on him, his room, his caretakers, and his visitors. "Aval" (She), the most complicated one among the four, revolves around a traumatic incident in the life of a woman. In all four parts, there are hardly any dialogues, the major characters don't have names, their background and past are not introduced to the viewers, which makes the themes of each part universal by the decontextualization of the stories in the film. This

also channels the attention of the viewers to the focus of the themes presented in each part. Though the two-hour film has four parts in it, the director succeeds in conveying his theme from the title to the whole/all parts of the film. The film has a mixture of both *akam* and *puram* constituents which constantly engage with each other and adhere to Selby's idea of *akam* and *puram*. As the title of the film suggests, there is an unresolved question in the whole film, *Akatho Puratho* (In or Out?) making one think, about whether the elements (particularly the protagonists) are inside or outside. The concept of *akam* and *puram* also is seen as binary in some contexts. Therefore, the application of the *akam* and *puram* concept is possible in every situation in the film. The film *Akatho Puratho,* implicitly and explicitly, discusses the dichotomy and diffusion of *akam* and *puram*.

The first part, "Malsyam," opens with the scene of a fish's movement in a pond. The fish seems to be the protagonist as all the sequences in the film are from the perspective of the fish. Contrasting the first scene, which shows the outer/exterior environment, the next scene is located in the interior of a home—an ariel shot of a couple waking up from their bed in the early morning. The next few scenes take the viewer's attention back to the outside of the house—ants moving, a cat on slow-wave sleep, a man sharpening his fishing hook, another man taking his tools and cycling his way to work, extreme close-ups of ants moving, a woman cleaning a utensil, and a wife helping her husband. The initial montage shots represent the slow (in static shots) waking up of the entire village early in the morning. All the images are connected to the fish. The fish, in one form or the other, reaches everyone and everything characterised in the section through the process of the food chain. The fish here is a metaphor for the energy that never gets destroyed, but changes its form, identity and flows beyond any boundaries. The fish becomes a predator as well as prey (discussed later in the essay), making itself an integral link in the food chain. In the film, the fish feeds on the water weeds or insects and later becomes food for humans, animals, and insects, thus returning to the soil. The transformative energy of life (like in the food chain) thus transcends the boundaries of *akam* and *puram* as it flows through different segments that constitute these spaces. Alex writes about *akam* and *puram* thus:

The definition of *akam* as 'interior' and 'inside' refers to the part of the home which is a closed space—one's own house in *tinai* poetry—where peace and love are ensured. *Puram* is the 'other'—that which is unfamiliar, unknown and unpredictable and that which is an open space and which does not belong to one's home. (23)

In this transition, the main character of this part of the film—the fish—is otherized

and forced out of its *akam* (home) to the fried fish on the plates of the members of the family. In the scenes aforementioned, like the fish moving in the pond, and the cat lounging undisturbed, we find that their respective *akam*s are at peace. Similarly, for the couple who are sleeping peacefully, the interior of their home, their room is their *akam*. So, what is defined as *akam* for humans, could be *puram* for other living beings. For example, the fish's *akam* is the pond and by taking it out of its home or safe space to human-populated spaces, the fish is taken to its *puram*—the "unfamiliar, unknown and unpredictable" space (Alex 23). Albeit, for humans, it is vice versa. So, *akam* for one could be *puram* for another.

The *akam* and *puram* counterparts thus engage to form a well-balanced space—a nexus of living and non-living beings. The space where the *akam* and *puram* overlap facilitates a functional space for the organisms to transpose and operate between both. If the equilibrium between the *akam* and *puram* is lost, or the poise of the entangled space tampers with inordinate interactions, then it will affect the space, organisms, people— their mental and physical health. In the film, the director portrays constant interactions of *akam* and *puram*, thus questioning and making the viewers think, what is or what constitutes *akam* and *puram.*

Fig.1. The fisherman with his fishing rod in the section, "Malsyam"

Throughout the first part, "Malsyam," the director has given us instances where the *akam* and *puram* interact. The scene where a man walks beside the pond, all set to fish for the day, is shot in such a way to resemble the man walking into the forested area or unfamiliar space—his *puram.* Similarly, the scene where the fishing hook is tossed into the water, every time disturbing the calmness of the pond, and the scene where the fish tries to jump out of the bucket after being caught—a jump as to escape to its *akam*—are examples of interactions and constant engagement between the *akam* and *puram.* These interactions create an entangled space and make the viewers reflect on the *akam-puram*

boundaries. It is in this space that the fish encounters its death. The journey from its *akam* to *puram* is also metaphorical to the transition of its own identity. The fish converts to food, waste, and later it goes back to the soil.

The scene with which the director ends the part is by portraying fish in a pond, just like how he started it. This scene is a metaphor for how the cycle is going to be continued, and the upper layer of the pond and the reflection on the water serves as a fragile line between the fish's *akam* and *puram.*

"Malsyam," *Akam-Puram*, and Ecocultural Entanglement

The complexity of the interrelations between the *akam* and the *puram* of living and non-living beings can be explained with the concept of entanglement. Entanglement can be defined as an "unfolding, often incidental attachments and affinities, antagonisms and animosities that bring people, nonhuman animals and things into each other's worlds" (Nading 11). The section titled "Malsyam" shows the complexity of relationships between animals, insects, cultures, traditions, and livelihood of the people as an entanglement. There are several families shown in this part. While one character prepares his ax and chopping knife (that is used in cutting branches of trees) by tying them to his bicycle, another character prepares his indigenous rocket-fishing rod. While the first character is a woodcutter, the other is a fisherman. Even though the story of the woodcutter is not pursued in the plot, the significance of various families getting ready for their daily chores is symbolized here. Similarly, there are shots of flies, spiders, and the forest that foregrounds the usually backgrounded nature. The story of the cat, given enough reel space in this part, is detailed with the catnap, its search for food, and finally eating the bones of the fish caught from the pond and fried for lunch. It is not merely the action of a few characters including the cat that is shown to the viewer but also the background of the action, contextualizing the time and space. The entanglement, in this section, leads to an *akam-puram* conflict (antagonism) in the case of the fish, but a peaceful relationship with the familial aspects of the people and the contexts portrayed in the section. The entanglement has a strong ecocultural (livelihood, relationships) element portrayed in the 12-minute section titled "Malsyam."

Unhoming the Goodness of the Tree

The 23-minute segment "Paava" (The Doll) is the journey of a piece of wood sculpted into a toy doll of an ideal family with a father, mother, and daughter glued onto a wooden base. The first part of "Paava" keenly shows the process of making this wooden doll.

Fig.2. The brown box with the sticker with the white border has its name written, "Nanma"

As the director chooses wood as the raw material for the doll, it implies that everything begins from nature, and human beings are enormously interconnected. The pieces of wood (i.e., the raw materials for making the doll) that are stuck together to chisel the doll is one form of a tree. The transformation of the tree to the wood to the doll should only be seen as different forms of the tree. It is the goodness of the tree that is transferred from one form to another; from one meaning to another, contextually. No wonder the goodness of the tree is named after the doll, "Nanma" (Goodness). The business of Nanma is also associated with the livelihood of a carpenter who sells his product to the retail shops in the place.

The relationship between trees and humans is an established one. There are folk literature, oral traditions, and ethical practices of safeguarding trees as if they are part of the family ("The Special Relationship"). The concepts of sacred groves, tree of knowledge, tree of immortality, and so on are practices/beliefs that reinstate the relationship in one form or the other ("The Special Relationship"). The hugging of trees during the Chipko movement was a display of one such relationship. But does the goodness of trees translate to the relationship between humans? Or do humans deserve such goodness from the trees? In a later part of the story, the doll named Nanma enters the life of a couple who wishes to get married. It is at this point that the doll finds a home (*akam*), at least temporarily. It is as though the uncertainties of the life of the doll "end" as it enters the interior space (or even the intimate space) of the woman. At a point the doll transforms to the man and the woman kisses the doll as if she kisses her man, and later sleeps with the doll. In a particular scene, the young woman tells her lover, "this (the doll)

is us." In a sense, the goodness of the tree experienced by the lovers is soon forgotten as the lives of the couple move on, probably departed in two different ways. First, a new gift arrives in the background of the doll. Could it be from a new lover? We can only assume so as we do not have any evidence for it in the film. However, the importance of the doll is eventually lost over time. The doll's place from the most favourite thing to a mere space-consuming material is evident at this point. It is carelessly kept under the bed, cupboard and is then broken, later thrown into the storage room. The doll loses the meaning of love (*akam*) handed to it. From the interior, it is thrown out as waste material with no meaning or agency attached. The doll rather witnesses the cordial intimate relationship of the couple and, also the end of it.

In the last part of "Paava," the labourer in the house gets attracted to a piece of the doll (the child sculpture in the doll) and carries it to his house for his toddler to play. Once it is broken in this house as well, it turns out to be a useless material (once again) in its "new home." This part of the film ends with the disintegrating of that wooden doll in different seasons.

The Entanglement of Materials and Emotions

The circular transformation of the wood from tree to the doll completes its cycle when it gathers moss in the soil once it is thrown out from its "final home." The doll finally reaches where it (reference to the tree) all started from—the soil. The doll being the protagonist of this segment, the foregrounded *akam-puram* would be that of the doll. In this context, the journey of the wood (the tree; the doll) marks the joy and unrest of relationships between the couple. The entanglement of the doll and the emotions of the couple showcase "an uncanny form of causality across time and space" (Jackson 137). In cinematic time, the intimate relationship between the couple is a short-lived one, similar to the short life of the doll. Jackson argues that "the aggregation of human actions (and inactions) produce not just these results [distancing], but undoubtedly a myriad of yet unknown, and perhaps unknowable, consequences—characteristic of humanity's environmental entanglement" (137). Though the reasons for the "making" or "breaking" of the relationship of the couple is unknown, and the consequences unknowable, the linear narrative of the film does not complicate the reel relationships for the audience—a rather simplified cinematic reality. Entanglement is not always an unresolvability or complication but embeddedness (which has a certain amount of complexity) that requires more attention and effort to reveal or unravel.

"Vridhan" and The Entanglement of Exteriorization

The third part of the film titled "Vridhan" (Old man) portrays the last few days of a sick, bedridden old man. Throughout the 35-minute part, the director has used a point-of-view shot, to present the old man. The viewers do not get to see the face of the old man, but we share his sight. The audience is allowed to take the sight of the old man; the perspective-shot makes it retrospective as well. Thus, by not picturing the man, the viewers can imagine anyone in the old man's place—it could be a stranger, someone from one's own household, or even themselves. His son and daughter-in-law are his primary caretakers. He has been bedridden for more than six months, as we later understand from the conversations of his caretakers.

In the opening scene, we are introduced to the interior of a household—a congested, dark space. The interior of the room has been intentionally made dark to create a feeling of "unfamiliarity—a *puram* effect" (Moses 163). The old man, as he is unable to move, has a monotonous, fixed perception—the tiled roof, hanging rope with clothes, the white wall, framed photos on the wall, and so on. There is a window on his right-hand side but he cannot turn his head towards it to see the outside. On his own, he is incapable of accessing the life-events staging just outside the window. As much as the viewers long to see what is beyond the confinement of the room, the old man is restricted in his vision and mobility. Even though the *akam*, to the old man, seems peaceful and the family takes good care of him, his boredom and stillness create discomfort for the viewers. The exteriority, in this context, has to be seen as a continuity of the interiority—a metaphorical and physical thin balance between the *akam* and *puram*. However, the *puram* or the exterior world reaches the old man through this window as auditory sounds. For the old man who needs help from another person even to move, experiencing the material aspects of the *puram* (outside) is improbable. Another means by which he experiences the outside is through the people who visit him. The outsiders/visitors (people who don't belong to the particular household) are a recurrent sight throughout the section. It is through them that the old man gets a glimpse of what is happening outside, like the group of people, a bride and groom, his relatives, and the wedding party that visits him after marriage. It is through these visits that the old man and the viewers understand about a wedding that has taken place in the family. Thus, the *puram* factors infiltrate into the *akam* factors of the old man, creating constant interactions between both. "They are interlocked and exist in a seamless continuum" creating an in-between space (Selby 23).

The *akam* and *puram* factors are in constant conflict within the section. For

example, the old man is in the liminal space between life and death. He is in a stagnant stage, where his caretakers are struggling to keep him alive with medical support, while death is constantly trying to win him over. This state of the old man should be contrasted with the naughtiness of the loving child and the bubbling life that is seen around.

Akam-puram dynamics might also work with the mind-body duality. The mind, which is an *akam* factor, and body, *puram* of the old man are also in an incessant discord. There is no coordination between the both. Even when the old man would want to escape the confinement of his room, his physical deterioration makes it inconceivable. This conflict is perceived by the cinematic effects of lighting and sound. Towards the end of this part, the pictures are blurred, the sounds are muted, just how the sick old man's health would deteriorate and his body would shut down to his environment. A recurring question asked by the friends and family who visits the old man is "*enne mansilayo*?" (Do you recognize me?), the answer to which is an unspoken, yet, subtle yes. There are instances where the camera stares (for the old man) at the people. At times, the camera goes out of focus, as if the tears block the vision. These are mild expressions that he makes. His deteriorating memory and health lead to the journey of his kin becoming strangers to him—their journey from his *akam* to his *puram*.

Another juxtaposition of *akam* and *puram* factors happens when the love of the old man's caretakers conflicts with their anxiety and misery. The misery of the sick man, and the difficulties of the caretakers in taking care of the diseased, is evident in this section. For instance, there are fights between the old man's son and daughter-in-law concerning the way the old man is taken care of by the latter. Though both of them take the effort to look after the old man, at times, it becomes taxing for both. Even when they both love their father, there is an anxiety about his inevitable death and the persistent financial and physical struggle the family undergoes. There is also the lingering distress about their livelihood—a *puram* factor. While talking to a visitor, the old man's daughter-in-law exclaims that she had quit her job to take care of her father-in-law, as he needs assistance, day and night. His son too is irritated and lashes out at his coworker, who visits him. He is agitated because he cannot leave for work, even though he wants to, as his wife cannot nurse the old man alone. It feels as if this anxiety and misery of the *puram* factors are gradually taking over the *akam* (love).

Fig.3. The old man given final rites before his death

Finally, towards the end of the section, the old man's family gives him *tulsi* water, as it is considered a holy practice, given to the dying, according to Hindu mythology. Those who once gave medicines to hold out the old man's life are here seen to accept his fate and let go of him—accepting his final journey from the *akam* to *puram*.

One sees a plethora of entanglements in this story, "Vridhan." The old man's room becomes a space for the entanglement to be staged. In this space, the *akam* and *puram* of the old man interact and overlap. He is in his safe space, but due to his physical condition, he might want to escape from his *akam* and wants to walk outside, on his own. His room is also the space where his emotions conflict with that of the others in the story. He lives in a stagnant condition—and in between death and half-life. Even though this space is seen as a safe one, the room later becomes the space where he loses his life, where he meets his death, where the transition of his energy takes place, where he loses his identity of a human to a dead body and "*akam* transforms to *puram*" (Alex 19). The entanglements of conflict-based *akam* and *puram*, with the emotional nuances of the relationships between the kith and kin of the protagonist, the unseen old man, lead to an exteriorization of the interior and the intimate space of the old man. The old man's emotional state is dependent on his life-experience with his livelihood, history, memory, things that he came across, his family, and people from his immediate circles. As much as his mental/physical/familial stability depends on the aforementioned factors, those agencies (things, people) are also influenced by him. There is a sort of reciprocity in the entanglement of relationships between people and things. Hodder theorizes the complexity of entanglement as the interdependence of humans with things, things with other things, and all of those things with humans—"sets of dependences and dependencies" (88). The old man's room, at one level, where the *akam-puram* conflicts and conglomeration occur

compliments the title of the film, *Akatho Puratho* (In or Out?), posing a question if the old man is in or out, ironically within his own intimate space.

The Entanglement of Home/Unhome

The final and fourth part is titled "Aval" which translates to "She." The initial scenes take the viewer's attention to the inside of a household—the *akam*. There is a mélange of images—a list of *puram* traits, all implying chaos: blood drops, a broken glass jar, a broken nuptial chain, a messy room, everything leading the viewers to imagine a dispute. Thus, in the first scenes itself, the interaction between *akam* and *puram* counterparts is explicitly showcased. Later, the viewers are introduced to "Aval," a lady who sits on the floor—downcast and despondent. Near her, lies the corpse of a man, whom we later realize is her husband. From her body language, expressions and context the viewers can easily decipher that she is the murderer of her husband. The conflicts and circumstances that lead to the murder are their fights over her extramarital affair with Arunlal.

It feels that she is in a fix, not knowing what to do. She sits there, broods and the next moment she is up, washes her hand, changes into new clothes, and packs her things as if she wants to escape the place. Again, she goes back to cogitating on something to be pulled back to reality, where her body stays numb.

The past is unveiled to the viewers once the third character, Arunlal enters the scene. The protagonist calls the latter and asks him to come over immediately. It is from their conversation that the viewers understand their extramarital affair which became the reason for the murder. She tells him that the couple quarreled over Arunlal as usual, and the murder happened at the spur of the moment. She becomes vocal about how she expects Arunlal to save her from her dilemma, but in vain. A shocked Arunlal tries to escape the situation, leading the lady to beg for his mercy. Convinced that he will abandon her, she kills him too.

Most complicated among the four parts, "Aval" exemplifies love in its all hues. There is love, illicit relationship, sexual pleasure, infidelity, separation, and death. In the film, the dead husband is betrayed by the lady, who later gets betrayed by her lover. There is love, but it is rooted in infidelity and betrayal. Classical *marutham* poetry of *akam*, delineates conflict in the post-marital state, due to infidelity of male partners and also showcases the theme of the wife's resentment. However, in the film, the female partner and the lover are disloyal to their legal families, by having an extramarital affair with another married man/woman, respectively.

Again, Arunlal can be identified as belonging to the *puram*. He is the reason why the peaceful *akam* got disturbed. The love and happiness that the husband and the lady once shared (that we assume) are evident from the wedding pictures—the smiling, happy, young, loving couple they once were. Though there might be other reasons why the marriage failed, the evident reason portrayed within the story is the relationship between Arunlal and the lady. He symbolizes the *puram* virtues like agony, lust that disrupted the love between the married couple. So, what belonged to the outside (*puram*) permeated into the *akam* and caused a complete collapse.

Fig.4. The protagonist, her husband and Arunlal in "Aval"

In this part, one can also unearth how the *akam* emits the characteristics of *puram*. The house which once fostered love and peace, between the lady and her husband, and also between her and her lover, has now become a place of conflict and death. "Combat is a typical *puram* concept" (Selvamony 215) which is evident in the story. There is love and sexual pleasure associated with it, that becomes the root cause of combat—*akam* that is manipulated to *puram*. Arunlal clearly shows an aversion towards her and wants to escape the situation. The conflict between love and rejection from loved ones haunts the lady. Love transforms into different shades within the story. The story ends with a haunting visual of her husband's and her lover's blood flowing to mix into each other, which might imply the bloody violent union of *akam* and *puram*.

The film, *Akatho Puratho* is described thus on the YouTube channel of Pace Productions (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=T50_ke3g10g&t=732s):

In or Out is about the inexorable flow, constant flux and endless process that Life is. Things and objects, humans, animals, insects, fishes and birds, all beings – in all forms, states and varieties, organic or inorganic, animate or inanimate, natural or manufactured, go through the process of coming into certain states of being, taking certain forms, evolve

into others, transform into other shapes and states and gradually decay and degenerate; but there is decay and destruction only in the human realm of passions and emotions, memories and dreams, not in nature, where every 'degeneration' is a form of 'regeneration'; what decays feeds another; what is 'dead' from a certain perspective is 'fresh and nourishing' from another. Though In that sense, life is nothing but a constant flux of states of being.. the incessant and inexorable flow of time. Time flows through everything, sculpting humans, organic and inorganic beings into forms and shapes, visible and invisible, solid, liquid, gas or plasma.

The film is described as an entangled space with a constant flow and flux of energy (i.e., the "life" attached to energy) that is present in living and non-living beings. Einstein's Law of Conservation of energy states that "energy can neither be created nor destroyed—only converted from one form of energy to another" ("Law of Conservation"). The film, at one level, claims to consider the "human realm of passions and emotions, memories and dreams" (description of the film copied from YouTube) as regenerative. The entanglement is not a linear amalgamation of two or three strands relating to life. It is rather a more complex one than that, a sort of interwoven nexus. In the section "Aval," she is the protagonist who defines her own space and future. She is strong and does not lose hope for life. She does not kill herself. She wants to live her life. This entangled flow of love-lust-hate of the threesome is definitely not about the rights and wrongs of relationships displayed in the section, but showcasing an entangled relationship. The pun on the idea of home as a peaceful, harmonious, romanticized space is seen when Arunlal's phone rings from the saved name, "home" but unhomes them. The love-lust-hate that disrupts two homes (unhoming) leads to death of the homes as well. Death is only another transformation or a strand in the entanglement of life, as life (energy) in some form moves on. The entanglement at the same time holds the cause and effect of the doings of the people at "home" but also turns out to be empowerment to the protagonist.

Conclusion

The whole film can be analyzed as a journey from open to closed spaces; from explicit, open, green spaces, in both "Malsyam" and "Paava," to the closed interiors in the last two parts— "Vridhan" and "Aval." In the first part, "Malsyam," there are a plethora of images that mark the natural environment. The ants, pond, lush greenery, soil, chirping of the birds, flies, and even the bedsheets, gates, and clothes used by human characters have prints and images of flowers and vines. More than the interior or the scenes inside the house, there are scenes from the outer (*puram*) environment of the house—the people,

the natural environment outside the house. In the next section, there is a fair representation of both the interior and exterior of the house. As much as the part portrays life inside the house, there are portrayals of public spaces like parks, roads, shops, and public transport. Similarly, there is an equal share of scenes picturing the inside of the home—the bedroom, storerooms, almirah, and so on. The *akam* gets equal representation in this part compared to the first part, "Malsyam." When we reach the third story, there are more inside—the home scenes. Implicitly, the outer world/natural environment might exist in the imaginations of the old man—how the bedridden man would envision the outside, from his past and his memories. In the last part, there is no representation of the outside natural world. Everything is confined to the interior of the house. No images of the natural environment or any tinge of green appear throughout the part. The last part portrays a closed space. Though all sections mark different kinds of deterioration, the degree of deterioration increase with each section. The disorder, collapse, and destruction augment when humans confine themselves to the inside rather than engaging and participating with their exterior counterparts.

The entangled spaces in all four stories are evidently seen in the interfaces between its *akam* and *puram*, arguably. The connection between these four sections is that only those parts of the stories of the interfaces of the contexts are told to the viewers. The cinematic part of these entangled spaces is that they are conflict-based, in some way or the other. The cinematic quality of the stories is lost if the conflicts are resolved and if the *akam* and *puram* are entirely contributory. Therefore, when the entangled spaces in the stories are seen based on these conflicts, it is a cinematic necessity to keep them alive.

<div align="center">**Works Cited**</div>

Alex, Rayson K. "Homing Ecophobia: A Study of a YouTube Clip on Tsunami." *Journal of Creative Communications*, vol.7, no.2, 2013, pp. 19-30, https://doi.org/10.1177/0973258613501053.

Harikumar, J.S. "'Akatho Puratho' suits festival audience, says director P.P. Sudevan." *The Hindu.* 8 Feb. 2018, https://www.thehindu.com/entertainment/movies/p-p-sudevan-on-his-new-film-and-his-craft/article22677856.ece. Accessed 28 Mar. 2022.

Hodder, Ian. *Entangled: An Archeology of the Relationships between Humans and Things*. Malden and Oxford: John Wiley and Sons, 2012.

Jackson, Doug. "Environmental Entanglement." *Journal of Architectural Education*, vol. 71, no. 2, 2017, pp. 137-140. DOI: 10.1080/10464883.2017.1343060.

Jackson, Doug. "Environmental Entanglement." *Journal of Architectural Education*, vol. 71, no. 2, pp.137-140, DOI: 10.1080/10464883.2017.1343060.

"Law of Conservation of Energy." *Energy Education*, 27 Sept. 2021, https://energyeducation.ca/encyclopedia/Law_of_conservation_of_energy#:~:text= The%20law%20of%20conservation%20of,it's%20added%20from%20the%20outs ide.

Moses, Srinivas. "*tinai* Reading of the Film *Godavari*." *Culture and Media: Ecocritical Explorations,* edited by Rayson K. Alex, S. Susan Deborah and Sachindev P. S., Cambridge Scholars Publication, 2014, pp. 157-169.

Nading, Alex M. "Introduction: Dengue in the Landscape." *Mosquito Trails: Ecology, Health, and the Politics of Entanglement.* California: University of California Press, 2014.

Selby, Martha Ann, and Indira Viswanathan Peterson. *Tamil Geographies Cultural Construction Space and Place in South India.* State Univ. of New York, 2009.

Selvamony, Nirmal. "An alternative social order." In Daniel, J.T.K., & Selvamony, Nirmal (Eds), *Value education today: Explorations in social ethics*. Madras and New Delhi: Madras Christian College & All-India Association for Christian Higher Education, 1990, pp. 215–236.

"The Special Relationship Between People and Trees." *The Living Urn,* 9 June 2019, https://www.thelivingurn.com/blogs/news/the-special-relationship-between-people-and-trees.

Resurrecting Culture:Ethnographic Surrealism in Alejo Carpentier's *Kingdom of This World*

Hanna Peerzada

Abstract: As the boundaries of Cultural Studies were expanding in West, genuine critiques of Ethnography also contributed to Cultural Anthropology's self critical period of decolonization in 1980s. Ethnographic surrealism was a term coined by James Clifford in 1981 in his classic essay "On Ethnographic Surrealism". The essay explained this strange confluence of Avant-garde art and the scientific discipline of Ethnography in France between the two World Wars, which he identified as "Ethnographic Surrealism". Through this coupling of two different activities and disciplines Clifford sought to cut across the retrospectively established definitions for both "ethnography" and "surrealism" and thus tried to emancipate the field of Cultural Studies. The surrealists looked for a way to renew European Art by means of incorporating into it the "exotic"; as they perceived it as the aesthetic and spiritual rejuvenation offered by non-Western cultures and thus enhanced Art's defamiliarization effect. Latino writer Alejo Carpentier had already contributed to Georges Battaile's journal *Documents*; to speak about the needs of the Hispanic American and his Caribbean socio-political context and also realized the inefficiency of literary modernism and its practices to be directly enforced upon the third world and sought to create a new nation through his work. Carpentier felt the need to express the American world. His novels describe lives of Cuban Blacks in sugar Plantations, presenting their beliefs, religion and culture in an atmosphere full of surprise and mystery. He embellished his novels with an exquisite baroque style and created a powerful counter-narrative by practising ethnographic surrealism in his novels and tried to negotiate between his native and modern experiences of Art and culture in France and thus created a culturally productive and liberating Anticolonial literature. This paper aims to study texts through the research perspective of Ethnographic surrealism and how it can be employed for analyzing and constructing marginalized cultures.

Keywords*:* Ethnographic Surrealism, Marvelous Real, Juxtaposition, Afro-Cuban Culture and, Vodou.

Evolution of Ethnography

The discipline of ethnography at an epistemological and ontological scale accounts

for the production of knowledge about cultures. (Whitehead 2004)

The discipline in the past has been accused of playing an instrumental role in disseminating the colonialist ideology and ever since the dawn of the postmodern theories and emergence of counter discourses from the postcolonial world, the discipline has been grappling with questions and problems like misrepresentation, misinterpretation and invention of marginal cultures by the western cultural anthropologists. These problems mainly arise because of the authorial subjectivities and the disciplines essentially textual nature which has been the biggest challenge for ethnography to deal with as for a long time it had been claiming for itself a scientific authenticity. (*Van Loon*, 2007)

Cultural critic, James Clifford attributes this crisis to the unavoidable authorial positions of the ethnographers and to the save the discipline from a complete erasure, he plays the role of a postmodern historian of ethnography by digging out from the past, minor narratives and instances of shared, hybrid and experimental practices to produce unprejudiced knowledge about cultures. He found solace in anti-evolutionist anthropology and believed that "primitive" could not just vanish into an undifferentiated modernity.

Genesis of Ethnographic surrealism

In the first half of twentieth century Carl Einstein was the leading figure in the field of avant-garde and ethnography and also the founder of a cultural journal *Documents* which was led by a dissident surrealist Georges Battaile.For traditional Surrealists, the interest in primitive was a revolt against the trappings of the civilization. . Surrealists main interest in primitive was to look for ways of the renewal of European Art by means of incorporating into it the "exotic" offered by the primitive; as it could become an instrument of intervention for evoking a defamiliarization effect The founder of surrealism, Andre Breton had himself said that the movement though basically aimed for the aesthetic development, could not be defined in fixed terms. A group of dissident surrealists after 1930's shifted their focus from the individualistic and authoritarian tendencies of surrealism and emphasized on cultural emancipation and showed their interest in anthropology, sociology and ethnography. Both modern Human Sciences and Art and literature grew in each other's shadow and profoundly interacted and exchanged practices and ideas and searched for common grounds.

The romantist escapism of surrealists also implied their latent exoticism and fascination for artefacts belonging to primitive cultures that offered their dull life an aesthetic and spiritual rejuvenation. The western world after industrial revolution and its

burgeoning capitalism had become more concretized and reified and lost its touch with vitality and innocence which they believed was at the core of the human nature. Clifford following the art critic Carl Einstein refuted any charge of exoticism . Clifford (1988) (Culbert et al., 2010) Therefore it was not a nostalgic escapism from stark realism but Indigenous legends and myths because of their recurrence and deep interaction with the environment in which they exist could be relevant even in the contemporary times. Even today in the non-western countries, legends and stories are being revisited and recoded to produce performatory texts.

Taking a cue from Einstien, Clifford coined the term ethnographic surrealism as a new research perspective in his 1981 classic essay of the same title "On Ethnographic Surrealism". It was a postmodern adaptation of ideas from 1920's. The essay explained this strange confluence of Avant-garde art and the scientific discipline of Ethnography in France between the two World Wars, which he identified as "Ethnographic Surrealism". Through this coupling of two different activities Clifford sought to cut across the retrospectively established definitions for both "ethnography".This collaboration had indeed led to the emancipation of cultures and Clifford obliquely suggested in his essay about the growth of a nascent anticolonial discourses as an outcome of such an interaction. Clifford (1988)Ethnographic-Surrealist approach in writing can be traced back to Micheal Leris' research diary *Phantom Afrika* , the famous French Anthropologist. Ethnographic surrealism focuses on the marvelous and the poetic of the everyday downplaying its confining rule- and norm-boundedness..

Ethnographic Surrealism does not imply that the ordinary reality has to be made ambiguous and vain but in contrast, ordinary itself proves to be Surreal when looked at with a keen eye of an ethnographer. Michel Leiris foregrounded an approach that pointed at the extraordinary of the ordinary by affirming his faith in the "sacred of everyday life". (Schwanhäußer & Wellgraf , 2019)

Ethnographic Surrealism was a term revived by Clifford in 1980s adapted against the context of postmodernism. Clifford Geertz's groundbreaking work The interpretation of cultures by Clifford Geertz (1973) highlighted the essentially textual nature of ethnography and the problems of interpretation related to it. Clifford and Marcus's collective work , *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography* in 1986 further elaborated this idea and Clifford for the first time coined the term ethnographic surrealism as a response to the prevailing debates. Stephen Tyler's essay in *Writing Culture* defines postmodern ethnography as "indeed a shift from the production of

documents of the occult to the production of occult documents....which would subsume all claims to "scientific" realism or "truth" to an essentially "literary" evocativeness". Thus *Writing Culture* went beyond by anticipating a speculative ethnographic research perspective.(Krupat,1992)

Although Carpentier as a main contributer to the journal *Documents* felt the need to express the American world. He had a strong faith in the progress and rise of Latin American cultures and desired for a fresh Latin American perspective after the decline of Europe which had followed a path of materialism and self destructive progressivism. His novels especially KTW describe lives of Cuban Blacks in sugar Plantations, presenting their beliefs, religion and culture in an atmosphere full of surprise and mystery. He embellished his novels with an exquisite baroque style and created a powerful counter-narrative by practising ethnographic surrealism in his novels and tried to negotiate between his native and modern experiences of Art and Culture and therefore constructed a culturally productive and liberating anticolonial literature (Scarano,1999)

. During his initial years Carpentier was a strong advocate of surrealism, and also an admirer of its experimental and formalistic aesthetics, which at its core was based on the ideology of subversion and rebellion to the cultural norms.

 However in his novel Kingdom *of This World ,* Carpentier repudiates surrealism's fetishization and reducing the non-western subject as the "other" to the west and became the enunciator of the Latin American literaturary tradition. Surrealists like Breton envisaged in the Americas a "New World" as an alternative and antithetical to the European subjectivity but yet defined Americas in terms of its relation to European subjectivity and never tried understand these cultures as an independent entity and complete in itself and from there focal point. As James Clifford affirms that these cultures "provided a reservoir of other forms and other beliefs" that Surrealism would exploit for aesthetic purposes. Jacqueline Barnitz also states that, Breton was actually "projecting a Eurocentric vision on a culture that seemed to fulfill his dreams of the marvelous and the exotic.".

Carpentier conceived Latin American identity in term of its regional, cultural and geographically bound   context , as opposed to Breton's universalist and hyper-subjectivie philosophy. Following a Eurocentric praxis would have made it impossible for Carpentier to justify the notion of a culturally independent Latin America and would have resulted in a mimetic Artistic tradition. (Garcia Ochoa, 2016)

Significance of Surrealism and Ethnography in Carpentier's Poetics of Latin American Fiction

In the novel's prologue Carpentier appropriated both ethnography and surrealism and formulated his theory of marvellous real as a response. In *Anthropological imagination Amy Fass* states that Carpentier portrays Latin America as a continent where the marvelous ceases to be merely a cerebral notion and becomes a reality, where faith is still stronger than logic.

Carpentier uses this definition of the marvelous real to articulate a narrative of Latin American identities that is culturally independent from Europe. He relocates Latin America as a cultural center, an independent agentcapable for immense creativity and innovation rather than being a desired utopia of Europe. As González Echevarría and Rodríguez Monegal point out, Carpentier's theory of Marvelous is an answer to Breton's lopsided definition of marvelous which he states in the first Manifesto of Surrealism in which he equates marvelous with beautiful and which survives in history as a residual and in fragments like the romantic ruins and symbols like the modern Art capable of affecting the sensibilities of people78 .In contrast Carpentier reinstates marvelous in the prologue of *KTW* as:

"The marvelous begins to be so unequivocally when it arises from an unexpected alteration of reality (the miracle), from a privileged revelation of reality, from an unusual or singularly favorable illumination of the inadvertent riches of reality, from an enlargement of the scales and categories of reality, perceived with particular intensity by virtue of an exaltation of the spirit that leads it to a "limit state…The wonderful thing invoked in disbelief - as the surrealists did for so many years - was never but a literary ruse, so boring, prolonged, like certain" arranged "dream literature, certain praise of madness, of which we are very much in favor. return". (Garcia Ochoa, 2016)

His notion of marvelous is not simply a tool of intervention that has to be employed to subvert, transcend and challange the realistic and mimetic mode of representing realities but a reality that is perceived in an amplified manner and which is naturally inherent to Latin American culture and nature. It is not manufacturing by combining artificial objects but Latin America's varied history, demography is already a marvelous mixture of improbable juxtapositions, where fantastic exists as everyday and commonplace .(Parkinson Zamora & B.Faris, 1995)

In the Prologue Carpenter not only creates a new definition of marvelous which

is intrinsic to Latin American reality but also challenges the aesthetics of traditional surrealists. He revisits and offers a critique of the French surrealist writer Isidore Ducasse whose surrealism was evoked by "the fortuitous encounter upon a dissecting-table of a sewing-machine and an umbrella!", and whose ideas were the most representational of Surrealism.

Carpentier recuperates the cultural heritage of Latin America, and to serve that purpose the ideas from the Surrealist school first metamorphize and then sublimate into his concept of marvelous real.

Carpentier's ambition therefore was much bigger than simply replacing the aesthetic praxis of surrealism. He attempt to normalize the magical. He is producing a faith based approach by drawing attention on the truth value in the magical and visceral by inventing the term like 'marvelous real" to legitimize the exclusively heterogenous identity of Latin America and by shifting the focal point to the cultural periphery from the centre he is re-approriating and relocating the idea of alterity, magic, otherness as was done by the surrealists before to paint the picture of Latin America as an emerging civilization. (Garcia Ochoa, 2016)

Amy fasss Emery's work *The Anthropological Imagination in*

Latin American Literature is a critical study about how Latin Americas' exuberant reality got reflected through the distorting mirror of anthropological discourses.

She gives credit to Roberto Gonzalez Echevarria, whose work was phenomenal in revisiting the anthropological discourses prevailing in contemporary Latin American literature.. Emery calls attention to the nexus between the regional literature and the various anthropological discourses that have disseminated through history. Emery closely examines various literary texts by Latin American writers of culture including Carpentier, and the various ways in which their authors negotiate with their authorial positions especially as their subject position of an"other" which has to be examined and which is the long standing debate of Anthropology.

In Carpentier's fiction one witnesses an adoption of the methodology of ethnographic surrealism. A deliberate use of the aestheticization of anthropological thought which distinguished the avantegarde between war years to which Carpentier was closely associated to, is clearly evident in his fiction work. Both ethnography and avante-critics during War years had developed a keen interest in the non-European artefacts which they incorporated in their collage for juxtapositioning them against their own hyper-indivisualistic and alienated modern culture .They confirmed with the theories of

Emile Durkheim and Lucien Levy-Bruhl which they advanced through their works. Durkheim believed in the social harmony and collective spirit that is still alive in primitive cultures and Lévy-Bruhl described primitive imagination and thinking as mystical and "non-rational", unaffected by the Cartesian split that disconnects the subject and his world and which is the foundation of the rationalist modern thinking. . (Emery, 1996)

The work of the Cuban novelist Alejo Carpentier (1904–1980) is often compared with other "artist-ethnographers most important amongst them being Fernando Ortiz (1881–1969) who is viewed as the founding father of Cuban anthropology based on the model of transculturation. (Maguire, 2011)

Carpentier also rejected the representation of a passive primitive through his works and followed Ortiz's transculturation model which was inspired by the avant-garde's critique of rationalism but the writers who followed this tradition also tried to inscribe a creative and conscious and contextualized depiction of natives through their texts unlike the surrealists who were critiquing modernity in general. Carpentier envisaged Latin American identity as symbiotic and rejected passive acculturation. He employs within his texts pastiche as well as juxtaposition to articulate the contrast between the two cultures and worldviews and brings forth how these cultures enter into a dialogue with each other and the oppressed slave culture plays a creative role for resisting imposition, rather than being relegated to an essentialist position of subjugation. (Emery, 1996)

In *KTW*, Carpentier resorts to historical ethnography and unlike his first experimental novel *Ecue –Yamba –O or (Faith in Lord)* which was stylistically indebted to surrealism and followed the modern ethnographic paradigm. In *Ecue –Yamba –O,* he is directly involved with the contemporary Cuban events but in his preface to *KTW* one can easily elicit that, he abandoned the participant-observer approach and instead construes his ethnographic methodology to achieve a second hand objectivity by selectively digging out the truth from the historical past.. (B. Miller, 2011)

Carpentier aims to discover, the essential cubanness, as way to reconstruct the Cuban identity; by bringing forth through this novel , the Cuban elements which he presented in contradistinction to the dominating foreign culture.

He has made strategic selections to gather insights from historical documents and various autochthonous traditions .William Seabrook's fantastical travel account *Magic Island* inspired in Carpentier an interest to visit Haiti in 1943, and study these phenomenon from an ethnographic point of view. His response was as overwhelming as his European counterparts and he personally visited Sans Souci where he experienced

epiphanies which have also been emphasized in his prologue to *KTW.*

In the novel the writer transposes his narrative to a different time-space than the contemporary Cuba as he wanted to claim an ethnographic distance as his main intention was to define essential cubaness without allowing the blacks in the modern nation to do that for themselves. To extrapolate on the contemporary situation in Cuba, the setting and time shifts to the Haiti island witnessing its first black rebellion in the year 1875.

Many parallels can be seen when comparing the imaginaries and experiences of Cuba and Haiti as both places have witnessed slave trade, colonial exploitation, and are intensely creolized spaces and were coveted due to their sugar plantations. Both places were treated as the exotic others by the western ethnographers and share similar national anxieties. Carpentier employs the Anthroplogical strategy of coevalness or using a different time frame and relocates the black culture outside their own history and nation space but in contrast to the western intellectuals who have engaged in this practice on purpose, to label black cultures as pre-modern, uncultured. However Carpentier uses the same technique   to promote the Afro-Cuban cultural practices as representative of Cuban autochthony, by constructing a genealogy that defies temporality and in order to identify, Afro-cuban culture as a representative of Cuban autochthony but without fetishizing like the modernists . Athough by throwing blackness into the past he does allows it to become an essentialist discourse for a moment but at the same time to understand this blackness one has to first encounter the textuality, which can be explored, intervened and construed in order to overcome the overwhelming primitive. (Maguire, 2011)

Haiti becomes a site where the intersection,and tension plays out between the two separate imaginaries, fragmented by classes/races. In *KTW* culture memory of Africa that entails its rich wealth of their oral traditions, myths, musical performances and an exclusive belief system is preserved and given access to us through the channel of two main characters that drive the plot of the novel. These characters also give us a peep into the very inception of the Caribbean cultural identity made up of the mythos, legends of their civilization which is constructed by the fusion of diverse cultural and ethical groups and a common slave experience. One of them is a minor slave, Ti Noel who works on the French aristocrat, Leomande mezy's plaine. He becomes the protagonist as it is only from his point of view that most of the events of the novel are narrated and another important character Mackandal a mandigiue, who escapes and becomes a fugitive , hunted by dogs, after he lost his arm while working tirelessly on the oppreseive environment of the sugarcane mills. Being a Mandingo he is a true depiction of the regional identity of Africa.

Ti Noel is deeply attached to him as for him, he was someone who had the power to evoke the stories of past which after his absence were no longer available to him, until later when he comes in contact with the old mountain priestess, who brings messages from Mackandal. Mackandal is treated by many critics as the protagonist of the novel. For the slaves he was a symbol of cultural authenticity, the personification of their homeland and a reliable nexus to their origins but for the French colonizers a fugitive rebel. Carpentier's understanding of Haitian culture and history, including his knowledge of Vodou, becomes a means for elaborating his concept of the "marvelous real" in the Haitian context. (Cortez, 2015)

Haiti's fascinating and vibrant Afro-cuban culture, and rise of a syncretic religion such as vodoo and charming history of being the first independent nation in Americas garnered attention and made it a focus of many ethnographies and travel narratives. The birth of Vodoun religion can be explained as a productive outcome of the fusion of West African religions that were brought under one roof by the common influence of the Catholicism. Carpenrtier's novel KTW calls attention to the significant role vodou has played in unifying African blacks and for the sake of creating a communal identity which propelled the revolution.. Gonzáles Echevarría defines this as a strategy adopted by carpentier to construct the Cuban identity which he achieves through first differentiating the barren and dull European culture from the rich Afro-cuban tradition and then infusing European catholism with vibrancy lent by the African creole culture. As Ti Noel visits the church one encounters an interface of two cultures in harmony with each other.In the Preface of *KTW* Carpentier had already anticipated about the links between Haitian vodou practice with the particular slant of Cuban Catholicism and reinstated that it is the realm of the sacred (the realm of the "marvelous real") where the Hispanic and the Francophone Caribbeans who are the black slaves will find common grounds..

After the revolution, the story of Ti Noël shifts away from Haiti and the setting moves to Cuba. Ti Noël's master M. Lenormand de Mézy seeks refuge in Cuba, takes along with him Ti Noël. While in Cuba, the two men find themselves in a Catholic cathedral, where Ti Noel experiences a different experience of his surroundings:

The Negro found in the Spanish churches a Voodoo warmth" that has "an attraction, a power of seduction in presence" that emanates from "The baroque golds, the human hair of the Christ, the mystery of the richly carved confessionals, the guardian dog of the Dominicans, the dragons crushed under saintly feet, the pig of St. Anthony, the dubious colour of St. Benedict, the black Virgins, the St. Georges with the buskins and 27

corselets of actors in French tragedies, the shepherd's instruments played on Christmas Eve" (Carpentier, Kingdom 87). (Stanley 2006; King 2009))

At another instance when Mackandal the rebel slave is caught by the whites and as they avenge themselves by throwing him into the bonfire, what the slaves behold is not his death but an escape. The slaves cry out, "Mackandal saved!" inorder to assert that they have emerged victorious and Mackandal has metamorphosed and are still alive. Here we can observe carpentier's clear attempt to evoke similarities between the blackness and the marvelous real. But yet the reader due to the intervention of third person narrator concludes that, what "really" happened was that Mackandal was executed since the official history also confirms that, Mackandal was indeed executed but the slaves' version still emerges as an "alternative" to the official discourse. Here the focus is on the slave's perspective which is fore grounded in marvelous real as they believe in the miraculous escape of Mackandal who is the hero of the slave rebellion. (Maguire, 2011)

Thus what for the slaves could have been a back breaking event and way to discipline them for evading any future rebellion becomes for them an inspiring model to instigate liberation. Gebert affirms that it is an "alternative depiction of Haitian history to emphasize the people's enduring faith in Vodou. (Gebert) 2004

Another important episode that reveals how sacred exists as a foil to the superficial rationality of west is when Pauline Bonnaparte sister of Napolean and also the wife of General Leclerc who had been sent to San Domingo by Napoleon to re-establish the institution of slavery, procures magical remedies suggested by her slave Soliman to heal her husband after he has contracted yellow fever. It is quite obvious that she betrays more faith in ritual healing practiced in the slave culture rather than visiting the doctor. Thus one becomes convinced how religion and subterranean forces prevails over and outplays the ironic disbelief of the so called Rationalism. (Figueroa, 2006)

Conclusion: Alejo Carpentier laid the foundation of a new poetics of marvellous real which informs the reader with exuberant anthropological details which reveals that his understanding of primitive transcends any Eurocentric duality that places primitive cultures on the two extreme edges of barbaric or innocent. . His theorization is a counter discourse to the artificially constructed juxtapositions of the orthodox Surrealist movement, still hooked to European episteme. His conceptualization is an enduring effort, in favour of representing a reality in which such juxtapositions inherently and already exist. He even became the part of the dissident surrealist group and spoke about the needs of the Hispanic American and his Caribbean socio-political context as he realized the

inefficiency of literary modernism and its practices to be directly enforced upon the third world and sought to create a new nation through his fiction. Although he was himself a great contributor to the mainstream literary modernism practised in France he enunciated the tradition of a localized modernism by negotiating modernist innovation, anthropological truths and liberating thoughts within the marginal context of Cuban culture.

Works Cited

Attributes".*The Cultural Systems Analysis Group (CuSAG*).University of M aryland .9-10.

Carpentier, A. (1948). The Kingdom of This World. Translated by Harriet De Onís, Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2006.

Clifford,J. (1988). *The Predicament of Culture: Twentieth-Century Ethnography, Literature and Art*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. 549-556.

Cortiz, C. (2015). „Alejo Carpentier: The Haitian Revolution, African Slave Culture, the Haitian Identity and the Dismantlement of the Institution of Slavery" LAC-seminar presentation, 7-8.

Culbert, J. (2010). *Paralyses: Literature, Travel, and Ethnography in French Modernity* 212-13.

Emery, Amy F. (1996).*The Anthropological Imagination in Latin American Literature*. University of Missouri Press. 1-9, 129-34.

Figueroa, V, (2006). „Black Jacobins: C. L. R. James and Alejo Carpentier on the Haitian Revolution", *Afro-Hispanic Review,* Vol. 25, no. 2, 55-71.

Gebert, Lizabeth P. (2013).The Haitian Revolution in Interstices and Shadows: A Re-Reading of Alejo Carpentier's "The Kingdom of This World" Portland State University,16-19.

King, N. A (2019). *Dialogic Reading of Alejo Carpentier's The Kingdom of This World* . Dallas: The University of Texas.

Krupat, A. (1992). *Ethnocriticism: Ethnography, History, Literature*. Berkely: University of California Press.   51-54.

Maguire, Emily. A. (2011). *Racial experiments in cuba. Gainesville:*UP *of Florida.* 4, 23, 84, 89

MILLER, Paul. B. (2012).Remoteness and Proximity: The Parallel Ethnographies of Alejo Carpentier and Ren´e Maran *, Taylor & Francis Group*, Vol. 66, No. 1, 6.

Ochoa, Gabriel G. (2006) „The surrealist Parallels of Lenora Carrington and Alejo Carpentier". *Journal of Iberian and Latin American Research*, Vol 22, issue 3. 284, 289-292.

Scarano, T.(1999). „Spanish-American Magical Realism" . *Coterminious: Magic realism and Contemporary Postcolonial Literatures in English*. ed. Elsa Linguanti et al. Amsterdam: Rodopi. 13.

Schwanhäußer,Anja and Stefan Wellgraf(2019) „From Ethnographic Surrealism to Surrealist Ethnographies" *Hubert Fichte: Love and Ethnology*, Salvador da Bahia

Stanley, Linda D.(2006) *Alejo Carpentier's The Kingdom of This World And The Spectral Voice of Communal Consciousness,* University of Florida.

Van Loon, J. (2007) *"*Ethnography: A Critical Turn in Cultural Studies". *Handbook of Ethnography* ,ed. Paul Atkinson et al. 273, 278 -79.

Whitehead,Tony   L.(2004)."Ethnography?Methodological,Ontological,and Epistemological P SEP

Zamora, Lois p. and Wendy B. Faris, (1995) 'Introduction', in Zamora and Faris (eds.), *Magical Realism: Theory, History, Community,* Duke University Press, 1-11.

Voice of Dissent on Globalization: A Study of Arundhati Roy's Radical Essays

Puja Ghosh

Abstract: Arundhati Roy has emerged as a 'dissident writer' of contemporary Indian politics expressing her voice of dissent on the West sponsored discourse of globalization in India through a series of politically conscious essays. I will argue through a close reading of Roy's texts that globalization, privatization and liberalization are the West's neologism to dominate the global economy. Globalization, 'the white logic', is unreal and misleading that wants to serve the sole cause of Western capitalism through the establishment of hegemony over the huge economic market of third world countries like India. Globalization is a mutually profitable business deal between the capitalists or Western financial institutions and the ruling elite of the Third World. Taking these theoretical arguments, the present paper will try to show how Arundhati Roy subverts the notion of globalization in India. Roy's voice of dissent on globalization fiercely goes opposed to the established norms of the capitalists as Roy colours her essays with mathematics of consequences of globalization in India. Therefore, the factual precision can not be denied that globalization is nothing but a Faustian deal on the part of India causing injustice not only to environment but also to the social, economic and cultural fabrics of Indian tribes and dalits.

Keywords: Dissent, globalization, privatization, liberalization, capitalist

Introduction

After achieving enormous fame and accolades from notable literary persons for writing her debut novel, *The God of Small Things* (1997), Arundhati Roy has turned her gaze to writing political non-fiction raising her voice of dissent on behalf of the voiceless, the silenced and unheard voice of the small things. Since the start of 21st century, Roy has actively engaged herself in the socio-political turmoil of India. This unique decisive stance does not come easily as "her own singularity has been a thorn in Roy's flesh" (Ghosh 128). For representing India as a microcosm of global political sphere, she has poised her literary oeuvre by being a chronicler of injustice.

If Noam Chomsky has been called "a darling of political dissidents around the world" (Barsky ix), Roy can be considered the inevitable Chomskian voice of India. For Roy, the choice of being adamant dissident writer is not a choice to be at ease, as Roy's

voice of dissent has been criticised as "hyperbolic" and "celebrity endorsement of social movements" by Ramachandra Guha (*The Hindu*, 26 November,2000).. But criticism and counter-criticism are integral parts of a writer or activist's stair case to fame. And Roy has internalized this trend by refuting the charges made against her and by marking Guha's comments as "flabby conclusions drawn from sloppy readings" (Ram 191).

Roy has started her non-fiction writing with "The End of Imagination", opposing India's decision to go for nuclear test. After that she has emerged as "the public voice of anti-globalization movement" (Mullaney 110) by penning down essays like "The Greater Common Good", "Power Politics", "Road to Harsud".

The Fewer Common Good : Globalized Development Project in India

The term 'Globalization' has the hidden potentiality of powering neo-colonialism or neo-imperialism or neo-capitalism in the first place. It is meticulously crafted as something beneficial to the developing countries by the minions of capitalism to dupe the Third world countries and to mask the intention of the West. In *Globalization and its Discontents,* Joseph Stiglitz argues:

The West has driven the globalization agenda, ensuring that it garners a disproportionate share of the benefits at the expense of the developing world. (Stiglitz 7)

Globalized development project in India has started in the late 1900s with the sponsorship of Western financial institutions (IMF, WTO etc.). Nehru's infamous and flawed association of Nation-building with dam-building has paved the way for policy mongers of corporate globalization. Globalized development has become synonymous with mass displacement, degradation of environment and doomsday for Indian tribes and dalits. Therefore, Roy as an interpretator of global corporate maladies, questions the promised benefits of globalization, privatization and liberalization by reporting with statistical mathematics of actual consequences. Thus Bishnupriya Ghosh is right in asserting:

Roy's use of a mathematical logic rather deliberately mimics the state's deployment of accounts against its people, it parodies corporate equations of costs and benefit. (Ghosh 140)

Roy, the vocal activist, debates about the ethics of policy-makers to make a deal with global capitalists or Western financial institutions without thinking about the rehabilitation of tribes and dalits, and environment degradation. In "The Greater Common Good", Roy makes her polemic strong by the fact that "in the first world, dams are being decommissioned, blown up" (Roy 92). The dam building agencies of the first world with a

large investment and technology aid find a way in the Third world market by providing means of personal profit to the pockets of politicians. That is why Roy states that "India's politicians have virtually mortgaged their country" (90) and that globalized liberal privatization in India is "a mutually profitable business contract between the private (preferably foreign) company or financial institution and the ruling elite of the third world"(Ibid). Therefore, corruption in the state and nation is the West sponsored malady of globalization.

The context of "The Greater Common Good" is India's unethical decision to build mega reservoirs on the Narmada river. Roy's debate is not superficial, rather it is quite logical to say that with the building of dams, there is a rapidly growing maladies of inequality and environment injustice. The majority of the river basin covers a large area of Madhya Pradesh and a few area of Maharashtra and Gujarat. But the building of large dam is more profitable to Gujarat than the other ones. Therefore it only hints at hammering injustice to other states. Apart from that Roy points out that there is emerging possibilities of floods, salinity and even earthquakes. Roy's indictment is clear in the statement that the building of big dams is helpful "to a nation's 'development' what nuclear bombs are to its military arsenal" (74).

The treatise, "The Road to Harsud", sequel to the previous essay, talks about the aftermath of building Narmada Sagar Dam in Madhya Pradesh. The surrounding villages of the dam lay like the wasteland of globalized development project. In another linked essay, "Ahimsa (:Non-Violent Resistance)", Roy ponders on the emerging possibility of corporate agriculture. Roy surveys on the issue of no rehabilitation arrangement made by the Government of Madhya Pradesh for the displaced people of Maan Dam. It is true that in spite of available land the state government has not made any attempt to help the poor tribal and dalit people living beside the reservoir. Roy is quite shocked at the fact that the state government is "to make huge tracts of land available for corporate agriculture"(185). Corporate agriculture will lead to the brazen means of snatching away the basic right to harvest as a farmer in the third world. The globalized development project is thus West invented policy to cripple down the economic base of developing countries. In recent time, India has seen the massive protest of farmers against the farmer bill that was supposed to be in favour of corporate agriculture. Vandana Shiva summarizes the foul play in the cycle of the dams and corporate agriculture :

The temples of ancient India, dedicated to the river goddesses, were substituted by dams, the temples of modern India, dedicated to capitalist farmers. (Shiva 185)

Roy's voice of dissent becomes so alarming and emphatic by the claim that dam building is "destruction masquerading as 'Development'"(Roy 309). As a literary critic of anti-globalization struggles, Roy can only permit a promising future of globalizing dissent all over the world to stand against the minions of monopoly.

Using the myth of Rumpelstiltskin, Roy sketches the evil consequences of corporate globalization, privatization and liberalization in the essay, "Power Politics". The essay is presented with vibrant illustration of facts and figures of failed globalized private project. The myth of Rumpelstiltskin is suggesting the fact that any deal with corporate globalized world proves to be Faustian deal for the developing countries. In exchange of false promises, the minions of globalization asks for the soul or the first born child that is the large economic market.

Roy defines privatization as "the transfer of productive public assets from the state to private companies" (81). The liberal private globalization is playing a mega game with dams, mines, power plants, public water of developing countries. Bechtel, a corporate conglomerate, contracted with the government of Bolivia to privatize the public water supply system only in a single city. The event hints at the dirt of privatization that the sole purpose of the deal was to get profit as much as they can without a single humanitarian concern. Citing the example of a single city in Bolivia, Roy questions for the need to privatize the public water and alarms the Indian citizens with the future possibility of privatization in India.

Privatization is the fatal narrative created by corporate capitalists to gain the goodwill at first and then to globalize the terror of power. The minions of capitalism primarily ask the developing countries to improve the environment of investment through privatizing the public sector and then they will go to the extent of looting through extended liberalization. Roy nurtures her voice against privatization by colouring her narrative with the failed project of privatizing the power sector in the state of Maharashtra. Roy criticizes Indian government's decision to empower Enron instead of extending helping hand to Bharat Heavy Electricals (BHEL). Roy's scathing satire is evident in the fact that the Enron's contract is known as the sweet heart deal in business cycle that is addressed by the epithet"euphemism for rape without redress" (*89)*

Conclusion:

Arundhati Roy has been misjudged by Ramachandra Guha as someone following the path of extremism by rejecting the discourse of globalization project all together (*The Hindu.* December 17, 2000). But a holistic approach would reveal that Roy calls for

sustainable development through globalization. She prays for pluralistic, democratic development of global society. She is crusading against capitalists'way of using the discourse of globalization for the sole cause of profit. For the third world developing countries, Roy suggests through her engagement in evocative narrative, the only way to resist the minions of Western neologism is by nurturing a culture of voicing dissent.

Works Cited

Barsky, Robert F. *The Chomsky Effect: A Radical Works Beyond the Ivory Tower.* MIT Press, 2007.

Ghosh, Bishnupriya. "Tallaying Bodies: The Moral Math of Arundhati Roy's Non-Fiction". *Arundhati Roy: Critical Perspectives.* Ed. Murari Prasad. Pencraft International, 2011. 87-100.

Guha, Ramachandra. "Perils of Extremism". *The Hindu.* December 17, 2000. http://www.hindu.com/2000/12/17/stories/1317061b.htm

---"The Arun Shourie of the Left". *The Hindu. 26* November, 2000. http://www.hindu.com/2000/11/26/stories/131260411.htm

Mody, Noman, et al. "Author-Activism: Philosophy of Dissent in the Writings of Arundhati Roy". *Asiatic.* Vol. 7, no. 1, June 2013. Pp. 55-72.

Mullaney, Julie. "Globalizing Dissent? Arundhati Roy, Local and Postcolonial Feminisms in Transnational Economy". *Arundhati Roy: Critical Perspectives.* Ed. Murari Prasad. Pencraft International, 2011. Pp. 110-126.

Ram, N. "Interview: A Writer's Place in Society". *Arundhati Roy: Critical Perspectives.* Ed. Murari Prasad. Pencraft International, 2011. Pp. 177-204.

Shiva, Vandana. *Staying Alive.* Kali for Women, 2010.

Stiglitz, Joseph. *Globalization and its Discontents*. Penguin, 2002.

Dreaming Utopian World of Pre-Pandemic

Dr. Rashmi Gupta

Experiencing excruciating pandemic world-wide

No Concerting wires of park, schools to visualize

No barrier of language, culture or disturbance,

But barriers and barricades of

De-ranged knee-jerk lockdowns

No jobs, labors on the road,

No health-care, no food, no shelter

on their head.

Ravaged the globe,

Thou unrimming 'corona Virus'!

Pervaded gloom and doom ubiquitous

As a river bursts out of a dam

As fence broken by rebels

Making us feel like 'caged in a zoo'.

But…

How long thou keep me in lock up

Preventing my insatiable desire to break-up?

Unfettered chains of 'social distancing',

'quarantine', 'home-isolation', 'mask-wearing'.

Days will be again Carnivalesque

Dreams of utopian borderless world

Will become picturesque.

In that Flickering Light

Srishti Raturi

Walking beneath those lushes boughs

each step towards the dusk,

the crystalline imagery reflected in my eyes,

I saw myself in that flickering light.

The distance increased by each step

passing beyond my means to forget

foreboding, formatting the exuberant force inside,

I saw myself in that flickering light.

Past and future, all residing confronted me

mixed feelings flaked every bit of me.

To the world I bear that image

supercilious, errant, preposterous and clandestine,

I saw myself in that flickering light.

Crossing the pavement read those eyes,

collecting flowers and jumping on the roadside

some in group, some in their conscience,

I saw myself in that flickering light.

A turn to new lane,

translated inner motion left behind.

Like shadow, some blurred, some lined

I saw myself in that flickering light.

Colliding to connect,

Amidst the shadow and light

Forged, collided, merged and aligned,

I saw myself in that flickering light.

Each step was away with another name

anyhow, things will never be the same

watching the shadow walking beside

I saw myself in that flickering light.

The doorway is forbidden,

cold vision and a started dream.

vapoured to the dim, closest to the eye

I saw myself in that flickering light.

The escape is home, coiled in a rope

it's the unraveled poetry befitting my mind,

unfamiliar, yet defined

and, I saw the world flickering in that light.

Our Esteemed Contributors

- **Dr. Jyoti Yadav** Associate Professor, Department of English Govt. College for Women, Pali, Rewari, Haryana, India.

- **Professor Neenu Kumar** English at Aditi Mahavidyalaya, University of Delhi, Delhi, India.

- **Dr. Shayantani Banerjee** Assistant Professor Amity University, Jharkhand, India.

- **Ms. Ayushi Zina** Assistant Professor Amity University, Jharkhand, India.

- **Pratiksha Dixit** Department of English, Nehru Gram Bharti University, Prayagraj, Uttar Pradesh, India

- **Chaya Malviya** Department of English, Nehru Gram Bharti University, Prayagraj, Uttar Pradesh, India

- **Mohana Das** Research Scholar, Amity Institute of English Studies and Research, Amity University, Kolkata, West Bengal, India.

- **Dr. Madhurima Mukhopadhyay** Assistant Professor, Amity Institute of English Studies and Research, Amity University, Kolkata, West Bengal, India.

- **Nithya K. Gopi** Research Scholarihh, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, Birla Institute of Technology and Science Pilani K. K. Birla Goa Campus, Goa, India.

- **Navaneetha Suresh** Research Scholar, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, Birla Institute of Technology and Science Pilani K. K. Birla Goa Campus, Goa, India

- **Rayson K. Alex** Associate Professor, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, Birla Institute of Technology and Science Pilani K. K. Birla Goa Campus, Goa, India.

- **Hanna Peerzada** PhD Scholar, Department of English, University of Kashmir

- **Puja Ghosh** PhD Scholar, Department of English, The University of Burdwan

- **Dr. Rashmi Gupta** Assistant Professor, English Language & Communication Skills, Maharaja Surajmal Institute of Technology, Affiliated to Indraprastha University, Dwarka, New Delhi, India.

- **Srishti Raturi** Research Scholar, Department of English, School Of Humanities and Social Sciences, Shri Guru Ram Rai University, Dehradun, Uttarakhand, India.